OFFICIAL





Oversight and Governance Chief Executive's Department Plymouth City Council Ballard House Plymouth PLI 3BJ

Please ask for Jamie Sheldon T 01752 668000 E jamie.sheldon@plymouth.gov.uk www.plymouth.gov.uk Published 16 January 2023

CABINET – SUPPLEMENT PACK

Tuesday 17 January 2023 4.00 pm Council House, Plymouth

Members:

Councillor Bingley, Chair Councillor Shayer, Vice Chair Councillors Drean, Carlyle, Dr Mahony, Patel, Smith, Stoneman and Wakeham.

Members are invited to attend the above meeting to consider the items of business overleaf.

This meeting will be webcast and available on-line after the meeting. By entering the Warspite room, councillors are consenting to being filmed during the meeting and to the use of the recording for the webcast.

The Council is a data controller under the Data Protection Act. Data collected during this webcast will be retained in accordance with authority's published policy.

For further information on attending Council meetings and how to engage in the democratic process please follow this link - <u>Get Involved</u>

Tracey Lee Chief Executive

Cabinet

8.	Plymouth's Future: Our Opportunity, Our Delivery Plan - Quarter Two Progress Update 2022 - 23	(Pages I - 22)
9.	Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023-2024 Revenue and Capital Programme	(Pages 23 - 52)
12.	Draft Budget Report 2023 - 24	(Pages 53 - 104)

Cabinet



Date of meeting:	17 January 2023
Title of Report:	Plymouth's Future: Our Opportunity, Our Delivery Plan - Quarter Two Progress Update 2022 - 23
Lead Member:	Councillor Richard Bingley (Leader)
Lead Strategic Director:	Giles Perritt (Assistant Chief Executive)
Author:	Ross Jago, Head of Governance, Performance and Risk
Contact Email:	Ross.jago@plymouth.gov.uk
Your Reference:	
Key Decision:	No
Confidentiality:	Part I - Official

Purpose of Report

This report provides a progress update against the delivery plan agreed by Cabinet in July 2022 for the second quarter of 2022-23. There are a number of progress updates within the report which include -

- The Plymouth and South Devon Freeport became operational on 13 October 2022 following tax site assessment and authorisation of a customs site;
- Along with Plymouth University and Exeter University, Plymouth city Council has been awarded £890k to look at MCA regulatory pilots around Marine Autonomy and Hydrogen Fuel Cells;
- The first homes have been completed at the new Stirling Project, Honicknowle, which has seen nine service veterans in housing need involved in the construction of 25 self-contained affordable homes to rent, with up to 12 of the homes to be lived in by the veterans themselves. The scheme is due to complete by September 2023.

Since the preparation of this report, there has been further progress which will be included in the quarter three report and includes –

- Plymouth and South Devon Freeport is the first of eight Freeports to be given the full green light along with two others. The Memorandum of Understanding was signed in December 2022 and the approval unlocks millions of pounds of grant seed funding and enables applicable businesses to join and take advantage of the Freeport status.
- the Memorandum of Understanding in relation to UK Shared Prosperity Fund has also been signed, details of the <u>Council's investment plan are available here</u>.
- Plymouth's role as a cultural and arts hotspot has been endorsed with renewed Arts Council England investment of more than £12m into the city's cultural organisations. Arts Council England (ACE) announced their three year funding deal for National Portfolio Organisations (NPOs) around the country. There are eight in Plymouth, which will get £4,113,239 a year over the next three years, a total of £12,339,717.
- The Christmas lights switch on in the Barbican and City Centre saw record crowds and help position the City as a destination for shopping, both in terms on independent shops on the Barbican and in the West end and Chains in the main City Centre.

The positive impact of Plymouth hosting Sail GP 2022 has also been made available since the last progress report –

- July's event, which reached a total worldwide TV audience of more than 74 million in over 175 countries, showcasing the city's stunning city and seascapes, and reaped an economic impact upwards of £10million, according to auditors Deloitte.
- It also attracted almost 16 million video views on social media. And the ripple effect continues to be felt, long after the competitors and more than 31,000 spectators sailed off representing 12 overseas nationalities with ongoing benefits from the enormously popular weekend, which received a 100 per cent positivity rating for the city and the seal of approval from the Princess of Wales.

Recommendations and Reasons

Cabinet is recommended to note the report.

Alternative options considered and rejected

There are no alternative options, this is a key reporting document that provides transparency on the progress of the delivery plan, and as such reporting this performance is considered best practice.

Relevance to the Corporate Plan and/or the Plymouth Plan

This report is fundamentally linked to delivering the administrations priorities.

Implications for the Medium Term Financial Plan and Resource Implications:

The Medium Term Financial Strategy is a core component of the Council's strategic framework and has a vital role to play in translating the Administration's ambitions and priorities.

Financial Risks

None as a result of this report.

Carbon Footprint (Environmental) Implications:

None as a result of this report.

Other Implications: e.g. Health and Safety, Risk Management, Child Poverty:

* When considering these proposals members have a responsibility to ensure they give due regard to the Council's duty to promote equality of opportunity, eliminate unlawful discrimination and promote good relations between people who share protected characteristics under the Equalities Act and those who do not.

None as a result of this report.

Appendices

*Add rows as required to box below

Ref.	Title of Appendix	Appendix Exemption Paragra If some/all of the information why it is not for publication of the Local Government Ac					you must I of Schee	indicate dule 12A
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7
A	Plymouth's Future: Our Opportunity, Our Delivery Plan - Quarter Two Progress Update 2022 - 23							

Background papers:

*Add rows as required to box below

Please list all unpublished, background papers relevant to the decision in the table below. Background papers are <u>unpublished</u> works, relied on to a material extent in preparing the report, which disclose facts or matters on which the report or an important part of the work is based.

Title of any background paper(s)	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable) If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box.									
	I	2	3	4	5	6	7			

Sign off:

Fin	Click here to enter text.	Leg		1on Off	EJ/38 851/1 6.1.22 (2)	HR		Asset s		Strat Proc	
	Please confirm the Strategic Director(s) has agreed the report? Yes Date agreed: 05/01/2023										
Cabinet Member approval: Cllr Richard Bingley approved by verbally Date approved: 05/01/2023											

This page is intentionally left blank



PLYMOUTH'S FUTURE Our Opportunity Our Delivery Plan

Quarter Two Progress Update 2022





Introduction and Structure

PLYMOUTH'S DELIVERY PLAN 2022/23

Plymouth's Future: Our Opportunity, Our Delivery Plan, focuses on the four key priorities of the Council's administration:

CREATING HIGHER VALUE JOBS

As a city, we recognise that economic productivity is the most fundamental and important factor that can help shape and improve our standard of living. This means we need to create good, high paying jobs. Over the long term, increased productivity is the key driver of economic growth and, together with higher and better-quality employment, the primary route to better living standards.

- Plymouth's productivity gap with the national average had been narrowing to 2018 but has since widened again. It is worth considering the Covid-19 pandemic is likely to have had a significant impact on the productivity measure for 2020.
- The city has a 'low wage' economy, in 2021, Plymouth full-time workers received £542.4 weekly compared to £612.8 nationally.
- Nearly 60 per cent of all employment in the city is within the science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM) sectors – the city has considerable strengths and opportunity for wage growth in key sectors including marine autonomy, digital tech, healthtech and defence.
- Provision of high value employment opportunities for our university graduates to keep them in the city is a high priority.

DELIVERING GOOD QUALITY GREEN HOMES

The city has set ambitious housing targets to match Plymouth's growth plans to 2034. Our current Plan for Homes sets out the ambition to directly support the delivery of around 1,000 new homes every year for the next five years. It includes support to deliver more homes for everyone to buy and rent, as well as an increased range of accommodation solutions including specialist housing, tackling and preventing homelessness, improving housing conditions within the private rented sector, reusing empty homes and neighbourhood regeneration.

- There are 8,000 jobs in the pipeline and we need good quality green homes to attract and retain the city's workforce.
- Homelessness is on the rise in Plymouth, as it is elsewhere across the country, with the number of households in emergency accommodation increasing over the last two years.
- Construction cost inflation, increased build quality requirements, supply chain issues and cost of living
 increases are negatively impacting delivery targets and the affordability of all house-building.

ENSURING DECENT EDUCATION

A crucial element in ensuring local children get the best start in life is making sure they reach their full potential at school. Plymouth's educational attainment levels have not kept pace with national benchmarks over several years, particularly in terms of achieving strong passes in maths and English. The Plymouth Education Board was established to address this, working to drive an improvement in standards.

- 59 per cent of Plymouth's Key Stage Two pupils achieved the expected standard in reading, writing (one
 percentage point above the national average) and 71 per cent achieved the expected standard in just maths
 (this is on par with the national average). Whilst progress has been made in closing the gap in performance,
 we continue to aspire to improve Key Stage Two outcomes for our pupils beyond the national benchmark.
- Currently only 61.1 per cent of secondary schools have a recorded Ofsted inspection of good or outstanding in their overall effectiveness.
- The city's education offer must provide the skills required to equip the workforce to fill 8,000 new jobs.
- We need to expand technical literacy opportunities for children and young people.
- We need to prepare children and young people for the changing landscape of work, to be engaged and informed in digital technology.
- We need to ensure children and young people understand career choices and the world of work and have clear aspirations for their futures.

PROVIDING ACCESS TO FIRST CLASS HEALTH AND CARE

The health system in Plymouth shares national challenges coming out of the COVID-19 pandemic, with delays in urgent care, elective waiting lists, accessibility of primary care and workforce challenges. Adult's and children's social care has also experienced increased challenges, including market capacity and increased complexity of need. We aim to influence health and wellbeing, with a focus on both adults and children who are most in need, through:

- Developing health promoting environments
- Encouraging healthy life choices
- Improving the quality of health and care services across the city
- Protecting the public from harm
- Developing and growing our workforce.

This report provides a performance update in relation to the Plan's measures of success. This first report provides quarter two performance 2022/23. The creation of the Plan has prompted the development and refining of performance metrics. Future reports will feature incremental deployment of additional indicators and dynamic selection of relevant performance data to ensure the plan is reported against in the most comprehensive way possible.

The purpose of this report is to provide a risk-informed analysis of performance against the priorities of Plymouth's Delivery Plan. The priorities are grouped under 'creating higher value jobs', 'delivering good quality green homes', 'ensuring decent education', and 'providing access to first class health and care'.

Direction of travel (RAG) colour scheme

A red-amber-green (RAG) direction of travel rating is provided to give an indication of whether performance is improving or declining based on the two latest comparable periods for which information is available. For example, the previous quarter or year.

- Indicators with arrows highlighted green: improved on the previous value or on an expected trend
- Indicators with arrows highlighted amber: within 15% of the previous value (slight decline)
- Indicators with arrows highlighted red: declined by more than 15% on the previous value
- Indicators with arrows that are not highlighted have no direction of travel or the most recent value is not comparable with previous values.

Target (RAG) colour scheme

A RAG target rating is applied for indicators that have a target. For these indicators, the bar for the latest reporting period is coloured either red, amber or green in the chart and in the table to visually display how we are performing compared with the target.

- Indicators highlighted green show where Plymouth is better than target
- Indicators highlighted amber show where Plymouth is within 15% of target
- Indicators highlighted red show where Plymouth is more than 15% worse than target
- Indicators not highlighted or 'N/A' show where no in-year data is available to compare against target, or no target has been set.

Priority Performance Dashboard

Star Actions

- * Target high-value jobs and business innovation through inward investment and support for growth sectors and enabling projects
 - Free port mobilisation is expected to bring over 1,000 jobs in the next two years, with thousands more new jobs anticipated in the Freeport's first few years of operation across a range of skills, trades and professions, including science, engineering and logistics.
 - Following submission and appraisal of its OBC, HM Treasury ('HMT') tax site assessment and HM Revenue & Customs ('HMRC') authorisation of a customs site, the Freeport became operational on 13 October 2022.
 - Recruitment of a permanent Chair of the Board of Directors, CEO and additional members of the Freeport staff team is underway
 - We are currently negotiating an MOU with central government which will allow us to draw on our seed capital grant to commence 'on site' delivery. We are also awaiting an update with regards the formal announcement from HMG of FBC approval
 - Our pitch for £19,946,417 of investment under the Government's Levelling Up fund to unlock a £43.551 million package of transformational infrastructure projects has been submitted and we are hopeful that the three key projects we put forward will be agreed.
 - Our Freeport website is now live <u>Freeport Plymouth and South Devon Freeport</u> (<u>pasdfreeport.com</u>)
 - The National Marine Park programme will deliver a transformed waterfront repurposing derelict buildings to engage, inspire and train our future workforce, which will support the development of 20 new 'blue' enterprises and create 464 jobs.
 - As well as providing an attractive place to invest, work and play, we want to raise aspirations to enable access for all too high value jobs. That is why every Wednesday throughout August, the Skills Launchpad Plymouth team have been hosting events across the city to promote engaging and fun learning opportunities with local residents.
 - **Port Strategy** with more than £1 billion of investment planned to take place in UK ports over the next 25 years, we are working to commission a port strategy to look ahead and support our ambition to unleash Plymouth's full potential as a major international port.
 - Associated British Ports, Brittany Ferries and Plymouth City Council are working on a funding strategy that will create more jobs at the port and beyond, more journeys to more destinations and for Plymouth to be a major player as new freight opportunities arise.
 - It will consider strategic Government funding available for freight, ports and net zero, as well as private investment to help establish Plymouth as a pioneering green port.
 - The benefits are not just economic if we can develop more exports locally and reduce our reliance on South East ports, as well as enhance the opportunities of

using sustainable energy sources, such as when vessels are berthed here, we can have a major positive effect on our carbon footprint.

- We have submitted and won a bid with Plymouth University and Exeter University to the regulatory Fund for £890k to look at MCA regulatory pilots around Marine Autonomy and Hydrogen Fuel Cells.
- We are supporting Babcock with a hackathon working with Microsoft to look how defence spend can have social value. This is about the sharpest minds looking at how we spend defence budgets we can maximise the social economic and environmental impacts. Babcock and the Naval base are the largest port operators in eth City
- We welcome and have supported the work Babcock have done around the economic impact modelling to help shape the Port Strategy.
- * Deliver major transport, infrastructure, and other capital investment schemes to further improve sustainable transport options (walking, cycling, buses, trains and ferries), new private sector investment, housing, job growth and resilience
 - Contractors Morgan Sindall have been to carry out the pre-construction design for **Armada Way.**
 - The dated and piecemeal landscaping will be removed and in its place will be a new urban park over a kilometre long, lined on either side by an avenue of trees. New features will include:
 - New stream, water play spaces and dancing jets
 - Improved sustainable drainage systems and biodiversity
 - Centralised pedestrian and cycle link through the centre of Armada Way with improved crossings
 - The aim is to create a more impressive route from North Cross roundabout through the city centre and a clear visual link to the sea, which was the original ambition of Armada Way. It is part of an ongoing programme designed to address years of under-investment in city centre streets and spaces.

* Drive the Britain's Ocean City brand and the National Marine Park, establishing Plymouth as a global coastal city to invest in, nationally and internationally.

- We are using events to position the City as a great place to live work and visit. The following are recent events which help position the city.
- The Christmas lights switch on in the Barbican and City Centre saw record crowds and help position the City as a destination for shopping, both in terms on independent shops on the Barbican and in the West end and Chains in the main City Centre
- The Council has facilitated an event for defence businesses to hear more about the Defence Technology Exploitation Programme (DTEP). With DTEP, there are individual grants of up to 50% of a project's value to a maximum of £500K per grant will be available through DTEP for collaborative projects between SMEs and larger suppliers, supporting the integration of novel technologies, materials and processes into Defence supply chains. Whilst this is a regional event this is being facilitated by the council to position Plymouth as the place to be supported to grow a defence SME
- Destination Plymouth is leading development of a wider city brand strategy to engage with cross sector businesses and look at future opportunities. A cross city brand development group will commence in February 2023.

- Destination Plymouth has been successful in a joint bid with Brittany Ferries into Visit Britain Gateway funding to fund a campaign into France in early 2023 to position the city as a short break destination.
- Cruise marketing internationally continues to be successful with 12 vessels booked for 2023 many of which have international passengers on board and growing the city's reputation as an important cruise and ferry port.
- The Conference Plymouth team has been successful in attracting the Napoleonic Federation Conference in 2024 which will attract delegates from over 150 cities in Europe.

Lobbying and Advocacy

- We have focused on levelling up and developing relationships with government departments to drive forward the next stage of Plymouth's regeneration. This has included a visit to Plymouth by the Levelling Up Unit in July and a further visit by the Cities and Local Growth Unit in November.
- The Council has submitted a £20m bid to the Levelling Up Fund Round 2 for a package of three infrastructure projects critical to the success of the Plymouth and South Devon Freeport.
- Plymouth was one of the first authorities invited to work in partnership with the Government to create Investment Zones. Whilst this policy has been rescinded, Investment Zones linked to Universities and areas of global significance are being considered and we working with the University to consider how to take forward once more details come out from government.

•

- Correspondence sent to the Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities in September to confirm our agreement to taking part in the first wave of discussions.
- The Leader wrote to the Rt Hon Simon Clarke MP, former Secretary of State for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities in October regarding Investment Zones and inviting him to visit Plymouth.
- Baroness Vere of Norbiton, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State at the DfT visited Plymouth in July to see progress on the Forder Valley Link Road scheme, and on some of the Transforming Cities Fund schemes.
- In September, Victoria Pomery, CEO for The Box, wrote to the Rt Hon Michelle Donelan MP, Culture Secretary, DCMS inviting her to visit during the British Art Show 9 (08 October to 23 December).
- As part of Maritime UK Week in October, Interim Freeport CEO, Richard May spoke at the Connected Places Catapult event in London.
- In November, Plymouth was represented at the Department for International Trade (DIT) and Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS)'s Green Trade and Investment Expo. Along with fellow UK Freeport programme representatives, the Interim Freeport CEO represented Plymouth on the 'Exploring the Role of UK Freeports in Delivering Net Zero' panel.

Quarterly KPI	Q2 2021/22	Q3 2021/22	Q4 2021/22	QI 2022/23	Direction of travel	Target
Employment rate (% residents 16 – 64 years)	77.4%	75.4%	75.5%	77.7%		Monitor
Annual KPI	2018	2019	2020	2021	Direction of travel	Target

Measures of Success

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Productivity rates (GVA per hour)	83.5%	83.5%	82.8%	Not yet available	-	Monitor
Business births per 10,000 residents	34.0	34.0	36.3	Not yet available		Monitor
Business survival rate (5 years to year end)	37.6%	37.6%	35.4%	Not yet available	-	Monitor
Gap in gross weekly pay between the bottom 20% and the top 20%	£350.30	£364.70	£338.20	£365.00	^	Monitor

Performance Narrative

The employment rate of the working age population of Plymouth has seen a considerable increase from quarter four 2021/22 (75.5%) into quarter one 2022/23 (77.7%) and is above the average seen over the previous year. The latest data for quarter one 2022/23 showed that at 77.7%, Plymouth had a higher employment rate than Great Britain (75.5%).

The latest available data for business survival rate features business births in 2015 and tracks them through to 2020. The percentage of new businesses surviving after five years, the South West has a rate of 44.3%, the UK at 39.6%, and Plymouth at 35.4%.

GVA per hour has decreased by 0.7 of a percentage point between 2019 and 2020. This is above the GVA per hour indices for the county (81.6%), although the rate of decrease for Devon was smaller (0.5 of a percentage point year on year). The GVA per hour indices for the region is 89.4% and the national average is 101.5%.

The gap in earnings has increased to \pounds 365.00 in 2021, which is on par with the earnings gap in 2019 (pre-COVID-19).

Priority Performance Dashboard

Star Actions

***** Deliver the Eco Homes programme

- A Council-owned site off Coombe Way, Kings Tamerton. Outline planning consent has been secured by Plymouth Energy Community Homes to deliver 70 affordable, net-zero carbon homes.
- This would be the first new-build scheme in England to use the innovative 'Energiesprong' approach to achieve net zero. The project will also be designed using 'One Planet principles', ensuring that it is truly sustainable.
- The project has been backed as part of the Council's award-winning Plan for Homes, which promotes exploring innovation in housing delivery. £330,000 has been allocated to the Capital Programme from section 106 contributions to allow the scheme to progress.
- Plymouth Community Homes, the city's largest social housing landlord, has revealed plans for a ± 33.5 million eco-friendly neighbourhood in partnership with Plymouth City Council, offering more than 136 new affordable homes in the heart of the city centre to rent and buy.
- A mixture of one, two and three bedroom apartments and townhouses will be developed on land off Bath Street in the Millbay regeneration area adjacent to Plymouth city centre, with modern, energy-efficient homes bordering communal gardens and tree-lined open spaces.
- The site, currently being used as a temporary car park bordering Martin Street as well as for some commercial properties, is primarily owned by Plymouth City Council and has been earmarked for residential-led, mixed-use development.

* Deliver a new Veterans Housing Programme, including self-build

- In June, the Cabinet renewed its commitment to the Armed Forces Covenant, which commits the Council to support servicemen/women and ex-servicemen/women to secure suitable accommodation.
 - The Council will offer suitable advice to Armed Forces applicants who present in Plymouth so they are able to access affordable housing in the city.
 - The Council will offer preference for those requiring social housing who are currently in the Armed Forces or leaving the forces.
 - The Council will allocate a proportion of stock through local lettings plans for Armed Forces applicants.
 - Develop appropriate housing schemes to meet veterans' needs.
 - Assisting with requests for adapted homes for wounded soldiers.
 - Those living in Plymouth Social Housing can be directly matched to a suitable property where there is a medical need.
 - The Council will offer relevant advice and support to injured veterans to help them access home adaptations.
- The first homes have been completed at the new Stirling Project, Honicknowle, which has seen nine service veterans in housing need involved in the construction of 25 self-contained affordable homes to rent, with up to 12 of the homes to be lived in by the veterans themselves. The scheme is due to complete by September 2023.
- * Deliver new and affordable homes in the city through our housing partnership agreements with housing associations

- We have agreed two Housing Partnership Agreements with two key Housing Association partners, one with Plymouth Community Homes and one with Livewest, and are working with both partners to identify opportunities to lever in increased investment on opportunities for new affordable homes in the city.
- * Complete the North Prospect, and deliver the Barne Barton estate regeneration schemes
 - At North Prospect phase 5 144 new homes have recently completed. The final phase 4 of the of regeneration at North Prospect is under construction by Plymouth Community Homes and Vistry, with all 196 new homes expected to be completed by March 24. This will bring an end to the regeneration programme that will have taken almost 20 years of planning and construction, and seen the demolition of more than 800 obsolete properties and the construction of 1100 new high quality homes, as well as the refurbishment of 300 existing homes, and the provision of community facilities.
 - In Barne Barton the demolition of the 120 vacant flats is underway at Talbot Gardens and social housing provider Sanctuary Homes aim to start construction of the first of the 160 new homes in January of 2023.
 - Clarion Housing have already completed demolition of the vacant flat blocks in their first phase of development at Barne Barton and expect to make a start on site by early Spring 2023 towards the first 143 homes in Phase 1 of the development. The remaining 61 are expected to commence in about 2 years time, following the demolition of the remaining flat blocks on this part of the site.

* Deliver a new City Centre Housing Programme in partnership with the Department for Levelling Up, Homes and Communities and Homes England

- We are about to embark on our next phase of regeneration in the city centre and have worked up a pipeline of projects with Department for Levelling Up, Homes and Communities and Homes England that we believe can be delivered at pace.
- Our priority projects are the regeneration of the West End, anchored by the delivery of a health and wellbeing centre; the regeneration of the railway station and its environs; Civic Centre and Guildhall projects to bring 144 new homes to the city centre, alongside a range of commercial and event spaces; strategic acquisitions of stalled sites in the city centre to gain control of these sites and accelerate their delivery.
- * Deliver a new City Council Direct Homes Programme to build new homes that people will be proud to live in
 - We have made a start on site at our first scheme at Broadland Green, Plymstock for the direct delivery of ten new homes for sale. We secured Government Brownfield Land Release Funding to pay for the demolition and site remediation and help release the site for homes. We are working with a local house builder (Classic Homes) to complete the ten high quality, energy efficient homes by December 2023.

Lobbying and Advocacy

- In May the Leader wrote to Eddie Hughes MP, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State (Minister for Rough Sleeping and Housing) to invite him to visit Plymouth and to share some of the excellent work being delivered by the Plymouth Alliance. Following this invitation, the Minister visited Plymouth in August to see first-hand the work of the Plymouth Alliance.
- In September Cllr Smith, Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning, Homes and Communities wrote to lan Hughes, Director of Policy at the Local Government Association (LGA), regarding the increasing cost of sustainable house building in low value areas; a follow up meeting was scheduled for the autumn 2022.

Measures of Success

Quarterly KPI	Q3 2021/22	Q4 2021/22	QI 2022/23	Q2 2022/23	Direction of travel	Target
Number of households prevented from becoming homeless	208	244	218	184	↓ 18	
Number of Households in temporary accommodation	265	287	359	392	•	Monitor
Annual KPI	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22	Direction of travel	Target
Net additional homes delivered in the city (cumulative from 2014/15)	4,608	5,301	5,836	Not yet available		4,620

Performance Narrative

During quarter two, 184 households were prevented from becoming homeless or relieved of their homelessness. However, there were some applications received late in the quarter that might progress to a prevention. The service achieved the annual target of 750 in 2021/22 and has achieved the target of 376 across the first two quarters of 2022/23. Pressures around homelessness and numbers in temporary accommodation remain. The Homelessness Prevention Partnership Executive continues to oversee the delivery of a single, structured and integrated multi-agency programme of work, with the aim of reducing and preventing homelessness in Plymouth.

Delivery is on track to meet the Plymouth Local Planning Authority (LPA) area target set out in the Joint Local Plan of 13,200 net additional dwellings to be delivered over the period 2014 to 2034 (annualised to 660 dwellings per annum). We have delivered 5,836 net additional dwellings over the period 2014 to 2021 and are currently significantly ahead (by 1,216 dwellings) of the Plymouth LPA cumulative target (4,620 net additional dwellings over the period 2014 to 2021). Of the 5,836 homes, 984 were affordable homes, which is an annualised average of 141 (17% of net housing delivery). However, this hides the significant amount of new affordable housing that has been delivered over the period (1,674 dwellings), accounting for 25% of gross housing delivery (6,682 dwellings). The major regeneration areas of Devonport, North Prospect and Barne Barton have seen the demolition of 690 poor quality affordable homes being replaced by the provision of new high quality affordable homes. The next update will be in December 2022.

Priority Performance Dashboard

Star Actions

- * Improving careers engagement activities linked to key sectors, particularly in STEM, digital, care and health, and education opportunities
 - Students from across Plymouth received their GCSE results in the last few weeks. For those
 uncertain about their choices and the next steps, the Youth Hub, part of Skills Launchpad Plymouth,
 was open to support young people, their parents and carers with impartial information, advice and
 guidance covering skills, training, education, careers and jobs.
 - Throughout August and September, the Youth Hub is offering summer drop-in sessions every Wednesday and Thursday. Alternatively, local people could access the Skills Launchpad Plymouth community roadshow event happening at YMCA Plymouth in Honicknowle on 31 August.

Lobbying and Advocacy

- In July the Chief Executive wrote to Mr. Peter Schofield, Permanent Secretary at the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP) highlighting the Council's success in the 'Promoting Diversity and Inclusion' category at the national Kick-start Awards. As the Kick-start funding had come to an end the Leader had suggested that a forum with Council leaders is established to hear in more detail how Kick-start has made a difference to young people in cities such as Plymouth
 - Following this letter a response was received from Mr. Mark Peck, Group Director, South West Work and Health Services, DWP in August confirming that he would be delighted to initiate and shape a forum to hear about future joint working and UKSPF Investment Plans.

Quarterly KPI	Q3 2021/22	Q4 2021/22	Q I 2022/23	Q2 2022/23	Direction of travel	Target
Percentage of early years settings and schools judged by OFSTED to be 'good' or 'outstanding'	9 7.0%	97.0%	97.6%	97.0%	-	Monitor
Percentage of pupils attending schools judged by Ofsted as good or outstanding	71.1%	77.1%	78.6%	78.3%	-	Monitor
16-18 year olds in education, employment or training	90.7%	91.4%	90.6 %	Not reported		92%
% of young people with SEND in academic years 12-14 (Key Stage 4) going to, or remaining in Education, Employment or Training (EET)	83.7%	82.9%	83.3%	Not reported		87%
Annual KPI	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22	Direction of travel	Target
Percentage of Key Stage 4 pupils achieving the Basics (5+ in English and Maths)	37.6%	47.1%	51. 9 %	45.9 %	-	Monitor
% of pupils suspended (number)	8.0% (3,088)	4.2% (1,644)	6.7% (2,618)	4.2% (1,601)	•	Monitor

Measures of Success

Performance Narrative

The Early Years Team works to ensure that all children attend high quality settings, especially the most vulnerable children and those children with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities (SEND). The Early Years Team is currently working with two settings that have been judged as less than 'Good' by Ofsted, as well as with other settings that have organisation vulnerabilities. The current priority is ensuring that the most vulnerable children and those with SEND attend quality settings and can take up their full entitlement, improving transitions, increasing the take up of two, three and four year olds, and supporting the sector with the recruitment and retention crisis.

There are 98 state-funded schools in the city and at the end of quarter two, 78.3% of pupils are attending a school judged as good or outstanding in our City. This is an increase of 7.2pp on the previous quarter. When we break this figure down in to the rate of pupils attending primary or secondary schools we can see that 87.4% of pupils are attending primary schools rated as good or better (compared to 83.6% at the end of quarter one) and 66.7% of pupils are attending secondary schools that are rated as good or better (compared to 47.0% at the end of quarter one). Overall the volume of actual schools rated good or better by Ofsted has increased to 78.2% at the end of quarter two from 71.1% at the end of quarter one. This is broken down to 61.1% of Secondary Schools and 79.7% of Primary Schools and 85.7% of special Schools.

Education, employment and/or training (ETT) data for quarter two is not reported due to the summer holidays in August and young people settling in to their education, employment and training (EET) destination pathways/choices throughout September. The proportion of young people who have secured their EET destinations has usually settled by November reporting.

The 2021/22 academic year saw the return of the summer exam series, after they had been cancelled in 2020 and 2021 due to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. As part of the transition back to the summer exam series adaptations were made to the exams (including advance information) and the approach to grading for 2022 exams broadly reflected a midpoint between results in 2019 and 2021. In 2021/22, 45.9% of pupils achieved the 'basics' (5+ in English and Maths). This sits below the national (49.8%), statistical neighbour (47.5%) and regional (49.2%) averages published by the DfE.

The phase improvement partnerships, including Early Years, Primary/Special, and Plymouth Strategic (Secondary) Education Group, continue to provide momentum for the place based approach for school improvements including absences and exclusions, reporting directly to the Plymouth Education Board and the Regional Schools Commissioner.

Priority Performance Dashboard

Star Actions

- ***** Implementing new 'out of hospital' services to help people leave acute settings
 - A new short term care centre to help people recover from illness and ensure they do not spend longer than necessary in hospital, welcomed its first patients in May. The newly refurbished short term care centre, which is being run by Livewell Southwest and Age UK Plymouth, has 24 en-suite bedrooms to provide a safe place for patients to stay after they have been in hospital.
 - This could be for up to six weeks, with support from therapists and assistive technology and opportunities to engage in social activities in the rest of the building. The aim is that when people leave the centre they are feeling much better and ready to go home and live as independently as possible.
 - The centre has supported over 140 people to leave hospital since opening and will be an extremely useful asset to assist the hospital through winter.
- * Continuing the development of wellbeing hubs and family centres agreeing funding for and delivering the West End Health Hub
 - Further property acquisitions have been made and demolition is about to start in Colin Campbell Court to deliver the new £40 million West End health hub.
 - The demolition work will take about 16 weeks and prepare the area for construction of the West End Health and Wellbeing Centre in early 2023. Work will also start this year on the creation of a "new gateway" from Colin Campbell Court car park into the West End.
 - The full NHS business case has been completed and approved by NHS Regional team, the project is awaiting confirmation of funding from the next spending review
- * Implementing new 'out of hospital' services to help people leave acute settings
 - A 40 bedded Care Hotel opened in October/November to support Derriford Hospital through the winter by increasing the amount of complex discharge capacity in the City.
- * Building on the 'make a difference' campaign to recruit and retain more care workers for adults' and children's services
 - A recruitment event took place at Future Inn in October to encourage more applicants to the health and care market, over 280 people attended. The recruitment campaign is being relaunched in December to support winter pressures in the system.
 - Adult Social Care we are currently recruiting adult social care staff (primarily care workers in Plymouth) into ASC roles. Providers have been prioritised and applicants are being matched. The first staff should start arriving in the next 2 months. We are anticipating at least 39 new staff coming into Plymouth
 - A newly commissioned provider is supporting the recruitment of 15 new children's social workers from overseas, to begin working in Plymouth over the next few months. The recruitment process has been progressing positively, with a good quality of candidates and a high level of interest.
- * Expanding mental health provision and availability for children and adults in the city
 - QWELL has been launched in Plymouth as part of an all-Devon online mental health support offer for adults aged 18+. It offers activities, content and a peer support community which is monitored by medical experts.

For children the Livewell Crisis Outreach team have now extended their availability and are available 8 am - 10 pm, 7 days a week for urgent assessment for CYPs who present in crisis to UHP. They also provide a liaison role to UHP for any young person with mental health need. The Intensive Home Treatment Team is also in place and operating 8am - 8pm, 7 days a week

* Star Action - Deliver a foster care recruitment campaign

• The commissioned service from Independent Fostering Agencies (IFA's) is being renewed with in partnership with Peninsula local authorities, with a focus on supporting agencies to recruit growing numbers of carers to meet the needs of local children, including a therapeutic offer which helps carers to look after children with the most complex needs.

Lobbying and Advocacy

- In July the Chief Executive wrote to Elizabeth O'Mahoney, NHS Regional Director for the South West. In her letter the Chief Executive highlighted the importance of the West End Health Hub to relieve a pressurised Primary Care system in Plymouth and requested the support of NHS England SW for the project, against a backdrop of continued local partnership working on the scheme.
- Following a Westminster Hall debate on the West End Health Hub in October, the Leader wrote to Helen Whately MP, Minister of State, Department of Health and Social Care in November, outlining the importance of the West End Health Hub to the city and asking her to honour the commitment made previously by the Rt Hon Robert Jenrick MP to visit Plymouth to broker a meeting between the local ICB chair, stakeholders, such as the Council and NHS England to move this forward.
- In August, Plymouth was announced as one of 11 local authority areas to receive funding (£1.24m over 3 years) to pilot social prescriptions including walking, wheeling and cycling to improve mental and physical health.

Monthly KPI	Jun 22	Jul 22	Aug 22	Sep 22	Direction of travel	Target
Patients fit for discharge but delayed longer than 24 hours – daily average during the month	42	40	35	43	•	Monitor
Quarterly KPI	Q3 2021/22	Q4 2021/22	Q1 2022/23	Q2 2022/23	Direction of travel	Target
Long term admissions to residential/nursing care home (65+)	70	63	76	66	•	Monitor
Number of children in care who are placed in a 'residential care placement' (end of month position)	61	60	55	53	•	Monitor
Annual KPI	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2021/22	Direction of travel	Target
Adult Social Care users who feel safe and secure	9 0.1%	89.8%	90.0%	87.9%	-	Monitor

Measures of Success

Performance Narrative

Since the beginning of the financial year the number of daily delays (24hr+) has been consistently lower than the numbers seen over the last winter period (October through February 21/22).

During September 2022 the daily average number of delays was 43, compared to 58 in September 2021, and in quarter two of 2022/23 the daily average of 39 is 24% less than in quarter one (51). The average length of delay has been on a declining trend since the end of April 2022.

Over a sustained period, the number of people admitted into a residential or nursing care home had been on a static trajectory. In the first six months of this year, we are seeing an increase; 120 people were admitted between April and September 2021, compared with 142 between April and September 2022, which is an increase of 18.3%. The proportion of admissions that are nursing care is on an increasing trend. There were eight admissions to nursing care in September, which equates to 47% of all 65+ admissions within the month.

The number of children placed within a residential placement is on a reducing trend and further reduced by two over quarter two from 55 at the end of June to 53 at the end of September.

No annual Statutory Adult Social Care (ASC) Survey was carried out in 2020/21 due to COVID-19. The 2021/22 survey shows a slight decline in feelings of safety, both locally and nationally. In Plymouth, 87.9% of people stated that services made them feel safe and secure, which is higher than the national average of 85.4%.

This report was produced by the Plymouth City Council Performance and Risk Team. For further information, please contact:

Ross Jago Head of Governance, Performance and Risk Chief Executive Office Plymouth City Council Ballard House West Hoe Road Plymouth PLI 3BJ

Ross.Jago@plymouth.gov.uk



PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL Agenda Item 9

Cabinet



Date of meeting:	17 January 2023
Title of Report:	Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry
Lead Member:	Councillor Jonathan Drean (Cabinet Member for Transport)
Lead Strategic Director:	Anthony Payne (Strategic Director for Place)
Author:	David List, General Manager Tamar Crossing
Contact Email:	David.list@tamarcrossings.org.uk
Your Reference:	
Key Decision:	No
Confidentiality:	Part I - Official

Purpose of Report

The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry have historically been operated together as a single undertaking on a 'user-pays' principle funded almost entirely from toll income. The undertaking maintains a contemporary financial model that incorporates income forecasts based on traffic levels. Income at the two crossings had been significantly reduced by the effect of Covid-19 and traffic levels have still not recovered to pre pandemic levels and are now operating at circa 90% of that previously.

This report sets out for consideration and approval, the proposed revenue estimates (budget) for PCC and CC Cabinet and Full Council for 2023/24 and indicative figures for the subsequent three years 2024/25, 2025/26 and 2026/27, together with the proposed capital programme.

The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns, and inflation, at an unprecedented rate. Unforeseen 12 months ago when preparing the Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme Report 2022-2026. The consequences of the economic situation impacts both the income and the expenditure of the Joint Undertaking. The assumptions used to calculate the revenue estimates and proposed capital programme were based on information available to officers at the time of report preparation. However, it is hoped that this level of increase will settle over the 4 year period, to those seen in more recent years.

The full report, with appendices, agreed by the Joint Committee on the 2nd December 2022, is attached for reference.

Recommendations and Reasons

That Cabinet recommends to Council:

I. That the 2023/24 revenue estimates and age after the draft 2023-24 Business plan, as set out in the appendices to the JC Report, be approved; and

2. The longer-term forecast to 2026/27 is noted.

Reasons

Without an approved budget, agreed by the parent authorities, PCC and CC, bridge and ferry operations would be unable to operate. An agreed, approved budget is a requirement of the existing governance arrangements of the parent authorities.

Alternative options considered and rejected

Not to approve the Budget as presented; rejected on the basis that Bridge and Ferry operations need to provide safe crossings 24/7/365, connecting communities, supporting the local and national economy and providing access to healthcare and leisure.

The do nothing option was also rejected; as it would result in the parent authorities not delivering safe crossings or meeting their responsibilities regarding a duty of care.

Relevance to the Corporate Plan and/or the Plymouth Plan

The Tamar Bridge & Torpoint Ferry links are key gateways to the City and provide opportunities for investment, jobs and growth particularly in the wider context of Plymouth as the regional economic centre.

Providing a safe well-maintained road network contribute to the economic well-being of the City, supporting the Council's Growth priority.

Financial Risks

The recommendations addresses the safety and operational requirements and reduces associated risk to the parent authorities.

Carbon Footprint (Environmental) Implications:

Continued service delivery will provide reliable journey times and minimises the potential for congestion or longer diverted journeys and related pollution.

Other Implications: e.g. Health and Safety, Risk Management, Child Poverty:

* When considering these proposals members have a responsibility to ensure they give due regard to the Council's duty to promote equality of opportunity, eliminate unlawful discrimination and promote good relations between people who share protected characteristics under the Equalities Act and those who do not.

Risk Management – This report addresses the requirement to continue with BAU for these important crossings.

Health and Safety – Key Performance Indicators within the Strategic Plan and associated Annual Plans are designed to drive improvement. There are no child poverty or community safety implications.

Appendices

*Add rows as required to box below

OFFICIAL

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Ref.	Title of Appendix Page 25	Exemption Paragraph Number (if appl If some/all of the information is confidential, you must in why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedul of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevan								
		I	2	3	4	5	6	7		
A	Briefing report – Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023/24 Revenue and Capital Programme									
В	TBTFJC Report 2 December 2022, 2 December 2021									
	Draft Minutes of TBTFJC Meeting, 2 December 2021									

Background papers:

*Add rows as required to box below

Please list all unpublished, background papers relevant to the decision in the table below. Background papers are <u>unpublished</u> works, relied on to a material extent in preparing the report, which disclose facts or matters on which the report or an important part of the work is based.

Title of any background paper(s)	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable)						le)
	If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Loca Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box.						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Sign off:

Fin	DIN. 22.23. 321	Leg	E /38 851/1 9.12.2 2(3)	Mon Off		HR		Asset s		Strat Proc	
Please	Originating Senior Leadership Team member: Philip Robinson (Service Director for Street Services) Please confirm the Strategic Director(s) has agreed the report? Yes Date agreed: 20/12/2022										
	Cabinet Member approval: Councillor Jonathan Drean, Cabinet Member for Transport Date approved: 05/01/2023										

Appendix A

Briefing Report -

Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023/24 Revenue and Capital Programme

Introduction

- 1.1 The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry are operated, maintained and improved jointly by Plymouth City Council and Cornwall Council on a 'user pays' principle, being funded by toll income using powers derived from the Tamar Bridge Act. The finances of the joint undertaking are effectively ring-fenced by the Act, and it is operated in normal times as a self-financing business.
- 1.2 The existing governance requires that both parent authorities agree an annual Budget to facilitate the undertakings as part of the operational delivery remit.
- 1.3 The budget for 2023/24 will meet the requirements of the Councils, in that it is balanced and affordable, even though traffic levels have remained below pre-Covid levels and are currently running at approximately 90% at both crossings, which is line with the 90% level incorporated in the financial model.
- 1.4 Appendix 4 of the TBTF JC Report, 2023/24 Revenue and Capital Programme contains the Annual Business Plan.
- 1.5 The detailed projection to the effect on the undertaking's financial position and the response of TBTFJC is detailed in Section 2 of the TBTFJC Future Financing Report at Appendix B.

2. Future Finance issues

2.1 There are concerns however that in the coming years, unless action is taken, there may be a deficit that would require addressing, as seen in the table below;

	2022/23	2023/24	2024/25	2025/26	2026/27
Forecast reserve					
surplus / (deficit)					
at 31st March	£0.614m	£0.192m	(£1.140m)	(£1.664m)	(£2.133m)

2.2 The Tamar Bridge Act 1957 sets out the default process to be followed if such deficits arise, namely that the parent authorities, Cornwall Council and Plymouth City Council cover that deficit for subsequent recovery at some later stage when the undertaking returns to a surplus position.

- 2.3 The primary reasons identified for the projected deficit are interest rate rises, currently circa 10% and energy costs that have risen exponentially.
- 2.4 A 30% toll increase was proposed earlier in 2022 with a request made to the SoS for Transport, this was agreed by the SoS and will be implemented in January 2023. The issues identified in 1.6 were not present when the assessment was made, to set the required Toll increase. The increase agreed by the parent authorities reflected the situation at the time with local authority due diligence regarding projected costs.
- 2.5 The TBTF JC Report (2.16 Reserves) shows the projected deficit issue (Table in 1.3 above) and concern was duly raised by the Joint Committee, who agreed that a Workshop would be held early in 2023, to assess opportunities and options to address the deficits identified.
- 2.6 The Joint Chairmen of TBTFJC and Portfolio Holders of both authorities have continued to lobby government to;

a) Have the ability to apply RPI locally, which will require Primary Legislation and is currently being investigated and

b) For long-term financial support for the Bridge, although this request has been without success to date.

2.7 Resolutions can be found in the draft minutes of the TBTF JC meeting on 2 December 2022 which are attached at Appendix C.

Report to:		Tamar Bridge & Torpoint Ferry Joi	nt Committee			
Date:						
Date:2nd December 2022Title:2023-2024 Revenue and Capital Programme						
Portfolio A	rea:	Cornwall Council: Transport				
		Plymouth City Council: Transpo	rt			
Divisions A	ffected:					
Local Member(s) NA briefed:						
Relevant So	rutiny Com	nittee:				
Cornwall	Council: Ed	conomic Growth and Developmen	nt			
Plymouth	City Coun	cil: Growth and Infrastructure				
Authors, Roles and Contact Details:	Roles and Contact 01872 322222 jamie.wright@cornwall.gov.uk					
Approval a	nd clearance	obtained:	Y / N			
Date next steps can be taken 2 nd Decem 2022			2 nd December 2022			
For Cabin	et and dele	egated executive decisions only				
Key decision? (≥£500k in value or significant effect on N communities in two or more electoral divisions)						
Published in advance on Cabinet Work Programme? N						
Urgency Pr	ocedure(s) ι	used if 'N' to Work Programme?	N			

Appendix B

Recommendation(s) to the Councils of the Parent Authorities via the Cabinets of the Parent Authorities:

I. That the 2022/23 revenue estimates and capital programme and the draft 2022-23 Business plan, as set out in the appendices to this report, be approved; and

2. the longer term forecast to 2026/27 is noted.

I Executive Summary

- 1.1 This report sets out for consideration and approval, the proposed revenue estimates (budget) for the Joint Committee for 2023/24 and indicative figures for the subsequent three years 2024/25, 2025/26 and 2026/27, together with the proposed capital programme.
- 1.2 The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns, and inflation, at an unprecedented rate. Unforeseen 12 months ago when preparing the Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme Report 2022-2026. The consequences of the economic situation impacts both the income and the expenditure of the Joint Undertaking. The assumptions used to calculate the revenue estimates and proposed capital programme are based on information currently available to officers. However, it is hoped that this level of increase will settle over the 4 year period, to those seen in more recent years.

2 Purpose of Report and key information

2.1 The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferries (TBTF) are operated, maintained and improved jointly by Plymouth City Council and Cornwall Council on a 'user pays' principle, being funded by toll income using powers derived from the Tamar Bridge Act.

In developing the budgets for 2023/24 to 2026/27 set out within appendix 1, the following inflationary and interest assumptions have been used:

Rates	2023/24	2024/25	2025/26	2026/27
Inflation CPI	7.5%	1.80%	2.00%	2.00%
Inflation RPI	8.30%	2.6%	2.80%	2.80%
Pay Inflation	4.50%	2.00%	2.00%	2.00%
Interest (Receivable)	1.00%	1.00%	I.00%	I.00%
	4.68%	4.68%	4.68%	4.68%

Interest (Payable) existing borrowing				
Interest (Payable) new borrowing	3.38%	3.38%	3.38%	3.38%

- 2.2 The second interest rate payable line above reflects the revised offer made by Cornwall Council for new loans agreed from April 2019. It should be noted that the rate will only be fixed when loans are taken out and future rates are subject to movement in the general market. Loans that predate April 2019 will continue to be calculated using Cornwall Council's historic consolidated rate of interest.
- 2.3 The proposed budget is set out in Appendix I. The variations between the latest 2022/23 forecast and the proposed 2023/24 budget are listed on page 5 of Appendix I. The 2024/25 to 2026/27 estimates are only indicative.
- 2.4 Some of the more significant items affecting the proposed budgets are as follow:
- 2.5 The **Corporate** cost centre currently shows a favourable movement of £1.686m.
- 2.6 Increasing the tolls by 30% has increased the forecasted income by £1.649m.
- 2.7 By issuing the tag statements electronically instead of being issued via the post is expected to save £0.068m.
- 2.8 Bank charges have seen an increase of £0.037m due to the increase in the tolls.
- 2.9 The **Bridge's** revenue budget makes provision for the ongoing maintenance and operations of the bridge and its infrastructure in line with current engineering practices. The movement from the previous year shows an adverse movement of £0.674m. The main changes from the previous year are:
- 2.9.1 Staffing including agency is showing an increase £0.052m due to pay awards and inflation rises.
- 2.9.2 Bridge and gantry inspections is showing an increase of £0.320m due to the requirements for 2023/24.
- 2.9.3 Energy costs are showing an increase of £0.154m due to rising electricity costs
- 2.9.4 Toll cash handling and collection is showing an increase of £0.057m due to inflation rises.
- 2.9.5 Operational expenses have increased by £0.088m owing to the consumer price index (CPI) estimate of 7.5% for next year.

- 2.10 The **Ferry's** revenue budget also makes a provision for the ongoing maintenance and operation of the ferries and their associated infrastructure in line with current engineering practices. The movement from the previous year shows an adverse increase of £0.529m. The main changes are as follows:
- 2.10.1 Staffing including agency staff is showing an increase of £0.391m due to pay awards, inflation rises and issues recruiting.
- 2.10.2 Repairs & Maintenance (R&M) building and ground maintenance is forecasting a saving of £0.043m.
- 2.10.3 Marine oil has increased by £0.029m
- 2.10.4 The other areas have been hit by inflation rises due to CPI being estimated at 7.5% for 2023/24.
- 2.11 The **Learning Centre** costs has increase by £0.021m, mainly to due to a £0.018m increase in activities.
- 2.12 Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) and Interest repayments have reduced by £0.047m following:
 - Re-profile of £0.125m Bridge LED lighting into 2022/23 and a reduction in costs of £0.125m.
 - Re-profile of £0.900m ferry traffic control systems into 2022/23.
 - Reduction of £1.300m in the Bridge resurfacing and £0.200m re-profiled into 2022/23.
 - Additional £0.400m for Bridge Deck waterproof/drainage.
 - Movement of £0.200m for the Parapet Works into 2022/23 as a future scheme
- 2.13 The proposed Capital Programme is shown in Appendix 2. Work has been undertaken by officers to assess the current capital programme and the revised estimate for 2022/23 is now anticipated at £2.841m, a decrease of £2.059m based on the changes below:
 - Re-profile of £1.500m for Rocker/Pendle remedial works into 23/24
 - Re-profile of £0.900m ferry traffic control systems into 2023/24
 - Reduction of £0.125m Bridge LED lighting
 - Additional £0.400m for toll system updated.
- 2.14 Two indicative future schemes have been added for 2023/24, £0.300m for Torpoint offices and workshops refurbishment and £0.400m for Toll Booth replacement.

2.15 **Reserves** – the reserve position as at 31st March (Appendix 3) is shown in the table below:

	2022/23	2023/24	2024/25	2025/26	2026/27
Forecast reserve surplus / (deficit)					
at 31st March	£0.614m	£0.192m	(£1.140m)	(£1.664m)	(£2.133m)

2.16 The Joint Committee receive a quarterly update on its financial position in order to provide assurance that the finances of the undertaking are being managed appropriately and that any significant issues are highlighted and necessary action is taken to address them.

Annual Business Plan

2.17 The Terms of Reference for the Undertaking requires that an Annual Business Plan accompanies the budgets for approval by Full Councils. The 2023/24 Draft Business Plan attached as Appendix 4, is a single year plan recognising that a full review of this process may be required following any feedback from the ongoing consultant's review.

3 Benefits for Customers/Residents

3.1 Appropriate management of finances and budget monitoring ensures that appropriate resources are available for the operation, maintenance and improvement of the crossings which form key elements of the local transport network which is essential to the sustainable economic and social development of the region for the benefit of residents.

4 Relevant Previous Decisions

- 4.1 Approved budget for 2022/23 at Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee of 3rd December 2021 (TBTF/34)
- 4.2 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s152034/2022%2023%20Revenue%20Estimate</u> <u>s%20and%20Capital%20Programme%20Report.pdf</u>
- 4.3 Approved budget for 2022/23 at Cornwall Council meeting of 22nd February 2022 (CC/148)
- 4.4 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s153916/Tamar%20Bridge%20Torpoint%20Ferr</u> y%202022-23%20Revenue%20Estimates%20and%20Capital%20Programme.pdf
- 4.5 On recommendation of Cabinet meeting of 9th February 2022 (CAB/88)

- 4.6 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s153587/Tamar%20Bridge%20and%20Torpoint</u> %20Ferry%20-%20202223%20Revenue%20Estimates%20and%20Capital%20Programme%20-%20Report.pdf
- 4.7 Approved budget for 2022/23 at City Council meeting of 24 January 2022
- 4.8 <u>https://democracy.plymouth.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?Cld=276&MID=9992</u>
- 4.9 On recommendation of Plymouth City Council Cabinet meeting of 11 January 2022
- 4.10 <u>https://democracy.plymouth.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=254&MID=9715</u>

5 Consultation and Engagement

5.1 The Joint Committee receive quarterly updates on the financial position

6 Financial Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

6.1 Financial implications are detailed within Section 2 of this report. Whilst this report only seeks approval of the 2023/24 revenue budget and capital programme, the forecast over the 4 year period includes assumptions and best estimates at the time of preparation. The forecast shows that the reserve will be in deficit early 2024/25, unless alternative funding or income, or reduced expenditure, can be identified.

	2022/23	2023/24	2024/25	2025/26	2026/27
Forecast reserve surplus / (deficit)					
at 31st March	£0.614m	£0.192m	(£1.140m)	(£1.664m)	(£2.133m)

- 6.2 The Joint Committee will need to consider a range of options to address the deficit reserve position. However, in the event that the reserve is in deficit at the end of a financial year, the Joint Parent Authorities would need to provide revenue support to remedy the deficit. This means that by the end of 2026/27 (based on current assumptions) cumulative revenue support required would be £2.133m (£1.066m from each Parent Authority).
- 6.3 Included in the 2025/26 assumptions is a return to pre-pandemic traffic levels. This will need to be closely monitored over the next 12 months as current recovery has only been around the 90% level (+/- a few percent) of the pre-pandemic traffic levels. It has also been suggested that the United Kingdom will enter an official recession in 2023, and historically when this has happened the Joint Undertaking has seen traffic levels reduce, which would put further pressure on the income budget.

6.4 The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns and inflation at an unprecedented rate. The financial impacts on the Joint Undertaking will be closely monitored by officers. Joint Committee Members will be kept informed through the budget monitoring reports presented at the quarterly Joint Committees in relation to the 2023/24 budget, and the Future Financing Reports in relation to the longer-term position.

7 Legal/Governance Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

7.1 The Joint Committee is being asked to make recommendations to the Full Councils of both parent authorities via the Cabinets of both parent authorities. Cornwall Council's Cabinet will consider this at its meeting on 8 February 2023 and Cornwall Council's Full Council will consider this at its meeting on 21 February 2023. Plymouth City Council's Cabinet will consider this at its meeting on 9 February 2023 and Plymouth City Council's Full Council's Full Council's Full Council will consider this at its meeting on 27 February 2023.

8 Risk Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

8.1 There are no implications associated with this report.

9 Cornwall Development and Decision Wheel

9.1 Not applicable.

10 Options available

- 10.1 To approve the proposed revenue estimate for 2023/24, capital programme and draft business plan as set out in Appendices I 4. This is the preferred option for the reasons set out in this report.
- 10.2 To not approve the proposed revenue budget for 2023/24, capital programme and draft business plan as set out in Appendices 1 4. This is not the preferred option as a revenue budget, capital programme and business plan must be set.

II Supporting Information (Appendices)

- II.I Appendix I: Revenue Estimates for 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.2 Appendix 2: Capital Programme 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.3 Appendix 3: Reserve Estimates 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.4 Appendix 4: Draft Business Plan 2023/24

I2 Background Papers

12.1 None

I3 Approval and clearance

13.1 All reports:

Final report sign offs	This report has been cleared by (or mark not required if appropriate)	Date
Governance/Legal	Lia Musto-Shinton	23/11/2022
(Required for all reports)		
Finance	Geraldine Baker	23/11/2022
(Required for all reports)		
Cornwall Development and Decision Wheel (Required for all reports)		
Service Director	Vicky Fraser,	23/11/2022
(Required for all reports)	Service Director – Environment and Connectivity	
Strategic Director		
(If required)		

Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee 2023-2024 Annual Business Plan

Contents

<u>Contents</u>	
Message from the Chairmen	12
The Context for the Annual Business Plan	13
Long Term Strategy	13
Meeting Customer Expectations	14
Budget Context	16
Performance Targets	18
Table I Safe Services	18
Table 2 Reliable Services	19
Monitoring Indicators	21

Message from the Chairmen

This Annual Business Plan extends beyond the last approved four-year Strategic Plan 2018-2022 agreed by the Committee in September 2017.

The Plan represents a continuation of an interim approach whilst the Parent Authorities, the Committee and management consider alternative approaches to business planning during the coming year. The provision of a single year plan ensures continuity whilst a review being undertaken with external assistance is ongoing.

The coming year will be an extremely busy and testing 12 months. The organisation needs to address the stresses caused by the current economic situation, particularly relating to inflation and increased energy costs, and the ongoing effects of the Covid pandemic on our income. The first of three refits will reduce service at Torpoint for a number of weeks in April and early May and major works on the bridge's main cables and articulation elements later in the year will be technically challenging. These projects reflect the Committee's continuing recognition of the need to ensure that the service provided by these essential and strategic crossings, under its control, remains robust and that programmes take a long view in maintaining the key assets.

It is that long view approach that has convinced the Committee to undertake strategic reviews of operational efficiency and the approach to long term business planning.

The Plan demonstrates our ongoing commitment to delivering a safe, reliable and efficient service to our users and it is intended that this document will form the basis of management reports to Members during the course of the year.

A summary of progress made against the Plan will accompany the Annual Report published in draft form in June 2024.

Councillor Martin Worth Joint Chairman Cornwall Council Councillor Jonathan Drean Joint Chairman Plymouth City Counci

The Context for the Annual Business Plan

Long Term Strategy

Plans for the longer term sustain the organisation's mission to provide safe, reliable and efficient crossings of the River Tamar. These plans are influenced by the Local Transport Plans of the Joint Authorities.

The physical and financial resources must continue to be available for major tasks such as resurfacing and repainting the Bridge and undertaking refits of the Ferries. Maintenance cycles may span consecutive Business Plan cycles, therefore while the medium-term financial plan spans four years, potential maintenance requirements beyond that period must also be considered within the organisation's general business plans.

The undertaking must maintain a clear strategy for the future to accommodate changes in traffic demand, user expectations, legislation and other factors that may stimulate changes in the way the undertaking operates and may require improvements to facilities. Therefore, potential change beyond the four year period of the medium-term financial plan must also be considered.

Continuity with the previous Strategic Framework

The Strategic Plan that expired in March 2022 contained a number of broad goals for the four-year period April 2018 to March 2022. Those goals remain relevant and are recorded below, with the continuing work to progress each goal. This approach is considered to be the most effective during a period when the organisation is developing new strategic approaches with the assistance of consultants.

Specific actions to achieve the desired outcomes are provided in KPI tables later in the document. These tables will allow Members, users and other stakeholders to monitor the performance of the service.

Strategic Goal: Meeting Customer Expectations

- Achieve or exceed service delivery KPIs
- providing more payment options for TamarTag customers
- providing a greater range of communication routes online
- undertaking major projects to ensure Bridge and Ferries are maintained to appropriate standards
- proactively communicate with customers
- expand scope and improve detail of traffic data

Strategic Goal: Fiscally Sustainable

- ensure that income can fund forecast expenditure
- act on an external review of operational efficiency
- routinely report progress and update financial positions
- improve management of toll debtors
- pursue the ability to index-link tolls

Strategic Goal: Transparent Governance and Clear Decision Making Processes

- consider alternative organisational models within risk and business efficiency consultancies
- adopt a revised approach to long term planning and business planning
- publish additional information and raise awareness of public meetings
- work towards a schedule of Committee meetings in Cornwall in addition to meeting in Plymouth
- consider ways in which the crossings might assist the Parent Authorities in addressing the Climate Emergency
- review legislation and governance

Strategic Goal: A Modern, Diverse and Well Trained Workforce

- act on workforce feedback and progress any recommendations from external review
- consider ways to mitigate recruitment issues in key specialist posts

Strategic Goal: Quality and Appropriate Standards

- improve pedestrian safety
- demonstrate our safety culture
- provide assurance about our approach to the environment
- maintain appropriate regulatory standards
- reduce environmental impact and ensure energy use is moderated

Actions Plan for 2023-24

The following detailed actions to meet the 2023-24 goals:

Meeting Customer Expectations

ACTION	Timeframe	RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRESSING STRATEGIC GOALS
Provide more flexible Direct Debit scheme for TamarTag customers	Spring 2023	Providing more payment options for cash and TamarTag customers
Expand the proactive customer engagement policy	Through 2023	Proactively communicate with customers

Fiscally Sustainable

ACTION	Timeframe	RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRESSING STRATEGIC GOALS
Review charging structure	Summer 2023	Ensure that the crossings remain financially sustainable.

Provide budget monitoring reports to Committee with updates to long-term model	Quarterly	Routinely report progress and update financial positions
Determine and progress the preferred route to enable index-linking of tolls	Ongoing	Reduce income risk
Complete an independent efficiency review of the undertaking	April 2023, report to Committee, June 2023	Assurance that best practice is being deployed to ensure that crossings represent value for money

Transparent Governance and Clear Decision Making Processes

ACTION	Timeframe	RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRESSING STRATEGIC GOALS
Expand independent publication of information	Ongoing	Publish additional information and raise awareness of public meetings
Undertake review of governance arrangements and consider new frameworks	Through financial year	Effective and transparent corporate oversight and challenge

A Modern, Diverse and Well Trained Workforce

ACTION	Timeframe	RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRESSING STRATEGIC GOALS
Implement recommendations from 2022 employee survey	Ongoing	Demonstrate value of workforce feedback
Review job design when vacancies occur to encourage more flexible working and part- time opportunities	Ongoing	Continue the actions detailed in Gender Pay Gap Reports
Review Employee Terms and Conditions	December 2023	Complete the actions detailed in external reports and action plans
Address any organisation issues raised in external reviews	Through financial year	Review legislation and governance

Quality and Appropriate Standards

ACTION	Timeframe	RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRESSING STRATEGIC GOALS
Upgrade traffic control systems at Torpoint and Devonport	2023 (Assumes recruitment of key staff)	Improve pedestrian safety

Certification of Occupational Health and Safety Management to ISO 45001 Standard	Autumn 2023	Demonstrate our safety culture
Certification of Environmental Management System to ISO14001 Standard	Autumn 2023	Provide assurance about our approach to the environment
Continue technical inspection programme at Tamar Bridge	Ongoing	Maintaining appropriate regulatory standards
Maintain ferries to classification society standards	Ongoing	Maintaining appropriate regulatory standards

Budget Context

The approved budgets for 2023-2024 are reported below.

Estimated income figures assume that traffic will be affected by major works at the bridge during the year and there is no growth in traffic volumes at Torpoint Ferry.

Forecast Income	£s
Toll Revenue (Bridge) Toll Revenue (Ferry) Tag Related Fees Income from Agency Charges Rents & Miscellaneous Income Grant Income Investment Income and Interest	14,211,000 1,835,000 460,000 446,000 110,000 0 0
TOTAL FORECAST REVENUE Forecast Expenditure	17,062,000
Bridge Operations & Maintenance Ferry Operations & Maintenance Learning Centre Corporate Expenses Interest Payments (cost of capital funding) Repayment of Capital (Revenue Provision)	5,431,000 6,556,000 135,000 565,000 1,673,000 3,124,000
TOTAL FORECAST EXPENDITURE	17,484,000
Forecast Deficit for Year	£422,000

Reserves

The forecast deficit will mean that the reserve maintained as contingency will reduce from a forecast $\pounds 14,000$ at 31 March 2023 to a forecast $\pounds 192,000$ at the end of March 2024.

Capital Works

The borrowing required to fund capital works during the year is anticipated to be £10,650,000.

Performance Targets

In addition to the quarterly reports on progress made to the Joint Committee, progress against the measures below will be published on our website.

Table I Safe Services

Description	КРІ	Target	Why this is important?
Number of accidents involving members of the public	Number of reportable incidents and accidents involving the public at both crossings	Zero and maintain	Public safety is an integral part of our business
Reportable incidents and minor accidents involving employees	Number of reportable incidents and accidents involving employees at both crossings	Reduce to zero and maintain zero incidents and accidents.	Staff safety is an integral part of our business. Need to mitigate risk to the lowest practicable level to avoid further accidents.
Lost time – employees	Days lost due to accidents	Less than 20 days	Provides a measure of the safety of the work environment. Reduces costs associated with absence or reduced capability following accidents.

Table 2 Reliable Services

Description	КРІ	Target	Why this is important?
Bridge traffic lane availability	Peak time lane availability Total lane availability	>99.5%	Measures success of traffic management and reliability of infrastructure. Ensuring that lanes are open is key to ensuring that journeys are predictable and reduces the
	Totaliane availability	>98.5%	risk of accidents.
Bridge toll booth availability	% of scheduled booth hours achieved	>99%	In addition to helping to ensure that journey times are predictable, the measure assists assessment of the performance of the contractor
Ferry scheduled crossings availability	Peak Time scheduled crossings achieved Off-Peak scheduled crossings achieved	To be confirmed	Measures success of vessel management and reliability of infrastructure. Predictable service is essential for customers to plan the best mode of transport.
Ferry waiting/journey times	Average journey time from entry of waiting area to exit off ferry Peak journey time from entry of waiting area to exit off ferry	To be confirmed (system extension pending)	Measures success of vessel management and reliability of infrastructure. Predictable journey times are essential for customers to plan the best mode of transport.
Bridge journey times	Average journey time between A38 Carkeel & St Budeaux junctions Peak average journey time between A38 Carkeel & St Budeaux junctions	< 5mins 45 sec < 6 mins	Measures success of traffic management and reliability of infrastructure. Predictable journey times are essential for customers to plan the best mode of transport.

Table 3 Effective and Efficient Services

Description	КРІ	Target	Why this is important?
F 1:			
Expenditure	Variance against budgets	Monthly review within 10% of profiled spend	Cost control, financial management, efficiency.
Tag Usage	Overall usage	≈60%	Maintains plaza capacity.
	Peak usage	≈80%	
Complaints			
	Response time	95% of complaints responded to within 10 working days.	Those making complaints remain aware that their comments are valued and investigations are prioritised.
Payment within 30 days of invoice date	% of invoices are paid within 30 days	>95%	Payment within terms assists the relationship with suppliers and improves validity of financial monitoring process
Staff sickness absence	Days absence per employee per annum	Average of <9 days	Reflects a healthy workforce and sound HR practices.
Energy recovered waste incineration	non-hazardous waste to be diverted from landfill for energy recovery	60% diversion	Reduction of waste improves efficiency and demonstrates our concern for the wider
Recycled waste	non-hazardous waste diverted from landfill to be recycled	40% diversion	community

Monitoring Indicators

In addition to the key indicators that measure the organisation's own performance, other indicators can provide information on aspects of service delivery which can by varying degrees be outside the control of the organisation.

The organisation also reports and monitors measurements widely used in the public sector and which are appropriate to report for reasons of transparency.

The indicators shown in the table below will be monitored.

Annual reviews will report the actions that will be taken in the course of the year that are likely to impact on these areas.

Description	Monitor Indicators	Why this is important to service users	Why a target is not appropriate or measure is partly or wholly outside our control
Complaints – Number received	Number	As an indicator of customer satisfaction	We wish to expand the ways in which users can communicate issues and encourage feedback. Any target works against this aim
Road Traffic Collisions (RTCs) occurring within Joint Committee controlled highway.	No of RTCs within Tamar Bridge/Saltash Tunnel tidal flow system.	We must provide a safe environment to users and ourstaff.	Many RTCs are due largely to driver error.
	No of RTCs within Torpoint Ferry traffic control area.	RTCs impact on service delivery, frequently requiring at least partial closure of access to or from vessels and	

Incidents of recorded anti- social behaviour onJoint Committee property.	Reported incidents at each crossing	Users expect a safe and secure environment	Threatening, anti-social or illegal behaviour is the responsibility of the those performing the act(s).
---	-------------------------------------	--	---

Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023-2024 Business Plan

Appendix C

CORNWALL COUNCIL

TAMAR BRIDGE AND TORPOINT FERRY JOINT COMMITTEE

DRAFT MINUTES of a Meeting of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee held in the Warspite Room, Plymouth City Council, Armada Way, Plymouth, PLI 3AA on Friday 2 December 2022 commencing at 10.00 am.

Present:-	Councillors: Worth (Co-Chair) and Jonathan Drean (Co-Chair) (None)
	Mark Coker, Hendy, Long, Tivnan and Toms.
Also in attendance:-	Councillors: Chaz Singh.
Apologies for absence:-	Councillors: Donnithorne and Pat Patel.

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(Agenda No. 2)

TBTF/15 There were no declarations of interest.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 30 SEPTEMBER 2022

(Agenda No. 3)

TBTF/16 It was moved by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Long, and

RESOLVED That the Minutes of the meeting of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee held on 30 September 2022 were correctly recorded and that they be signed by the Chairman, subject to the following amendment:- that Councillor Tivnan was also in attendance.

PUBLIC QUESTIONS

(Agenda No. 4)

TBTF/17 There were no questions from the Public.

GENERAL MANAGER'S QUARTERLY REPORT

(Agenda No. 5)

TBTF/18 The Committee considered the General Manager's Quarterly Report (previously circulated), presented by the General Manager.

In response to comments and questions from the Joint Committee Members, Officers advised that:

- 1. Members were advised that any costs cited in the contracts in the report were indexed to inflation and would increase over time.
- 2. Members were informed that replacing fibre glass toll booths would be quicker than refurbishment and although more expensive, the increased longevity of the replacement booths would offset the higher cost implications as well as causing less disruption to the bridge's day to day operations.
- 3. Clarification was sought on whether the decrease in bridge usage was reflected in a similar increase in usage of the A386, details of which would be sought by the General Manager from Devon County Council.
- 4. Concern was expressed that increasing toll rates would contribute to deprivation and would impact the local economy. Members were informed that any specific concerns should be given in writing to the Joint Chairs who would pass them on to our consultants at the next appropriate meeting.
- 5. Members expressed concern that there had been a lack of support for the Tamar Bridge from local Members of Parliament and Government. It was confirmed that Members and officers had written to local Members of Parliament seeking their support, with some responses offering support received. Officers had a meeting with the Department for Transport scheduled for the 13th of December 2022.

6. There was general support for an informal meeting between Members and officers to discuss terminology such as, 'the user pays principal'.

It was proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Worth, and

RESOLVED that: -

- I. The report be noted;
- 2. an updated report be brought to the next meeting.

It was further moved and proposed by Councillor Long, seconded by Councillor Coker and

RESOLVED that:-

3. An informal meeting be arranged between Members and officers to discuss terminology such as, 'the user pays principle'.

BUDGET MONITORING 2022/23

(Agenda No. 6)

TBTF/19 The Committee considered the Budget Monitoring 2022/23 report (previously circulated by the Service Accountant.

In response to comments and questions from Joint Committee Members, Officers confirmed that:-

1. Clarification was sought and given that there was $\pounds 11.48$ million in estimated expenditure and $\pounds 15.397$ million in estimated income. This would give an estimated operating profit of $\pounds 3.9$ million, however CCMRP payments of $\pounds 4.844$ million would create an overall loss of $\pounds 944,000$. Members were informed that CCMRP payments were minimum revenue provision re-payments made to Cornwall Council for loans issued to allow for capital works which has been a contributing factor in the reduction of capital reserves.

It was proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Toms, and

RESOLVED that:-

That the revenue forecast and capital programme for 2022/23 be noted.

2023/24 REVENUE ESTIMATES AND CAPITAL PROGRAMME (AND BUSINESS PLAN) REPORT

(Agenda No. 7)

TBTF/20 The Committee considered the 2023-24 Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme report (previously circulated), presented by the Service Accountant.

In response to comments and questions from Joint Committee Members, Officers confirmed that:-

- 1. Members were informed that by the end of 2024/25 there would be a deficit which was unforeseen at the time of writing due to the adverse economic climate and rising inflation which remained ongoing.
- 2. There was general support for a workshop between officers and Members to discuss in detail the revenue estimates in the new year, followed by a subsequent meeting between National Highways, other partner agencies and Cornish Members of Parliament to discuss the need for support on the maintenance of the Tamar Crossing and the A38.
- 3. Members were informed that recruitment was still an issue and while some vacancies had been filled, there were still remaining vacancies. Agency staff were still being employed but kept to a minimum.
- 4. It was confirmed with Members the break even point for introducing LED street lighting on the Bridge was around 4-5 years.

It was moved by Councillor Coker, seconded by Councillor Long, and

RESOLVED that it be recommended to the Councils of the Parent authorities via the Cabinets of the Parent Authorities :-

I. That the 2023/24 revenue estimates and capital programme and the draft 2023/24 Business Plan, as set out in the appendices to this report, be approved;

2. the longer term forecast to 2026/27 is noted; and

It was further moved and proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Coker and

RESOLVED that:-

2. That it is recommended there is a Members workshop to look at future financing and financial reserves up to 2026/27 and beyond. Also to subsequently ask National Highways, other partner agencies and Cornish Members of Parliament to attend a meeting to discuss the need for support on the maintenance of the Tamar Crossing and the A38.

The meeting ended at 11.32 am

Cabinet



Date of meeting:	17 January 2023
Title of Report:	Budget 2023/24 - Update
Lead Member:	Councillor Richard Bingley (Leader)
Lead Strategic Director:	David Northey (Service Director for Finance and Section 151 Officer)
Author:	David Northey
Contact Email:	David.northey@plymouth.gov.uk
	Stephen.coker@plymouth.gov.uk
Your Reference:	Fin/Bud/2023/24
Key Decision:	No
Confidentiality:	Part I - Official

Purpose of Report

To provide an update on progress on the development of the 2023/24 budget and to seek agreement to the proposed Council tax rise and make delegations to enable final preparations for the presentation of a balanced revenue budget.

Under the Council's Constitution, Cabinet is required to recommend the 2023/24 Budget to Council. This report sets out the latest information available to enable Cabinet to consider the recommendations to Council in respect of the proposed budget.

Cabinet received a report at their meeting on 10 November which provided an update on progress at that date on the development of the 2023/24 budget. The report identified the initial budget shortfall of $\pounds 11.394$ m. Over the last 2 months further work has been undertaken to enable this shortfall to be significantly reduced.

This report includes the outcome of the Provisional Local Government Settlement which was announced on the 19 December 2022. The focus of this report is the revenue budget. The scrutiny process will include the capital programme and full details will be included in the February Cabinet Report with recommendations to Full Council February 2023.

Recommendations and Reasons

That Cabinet:

- 1. Note this report, and that it is subject to change in line with any final Settlement adjustments.
- 2. Agree to recommend and endorse to Full Council on the 27 February 2023 the approval of a Council Tax rise of 2.99% and ASC Precept rise of 2.00%.
- 3. Delegate authority to the Section 151 Officer, in consultation with the Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Finance and Economy, to propose final adjustments to achieve a balanced Revenue Budget.

Note a final Revenue and Capital Budget 2023/24 will be presented to the Cabinet meeting 9
February 2023, to be presented to February Full Council.

Alternative options considered and rejected

The approval of Council's budget is a statutory requirement so there are no alternative options to producing a report. A final report will be presented to Cabinet and Full Council in February; this update affords the Scrutiny Committee an updated position. An alternative option to freeze or not implement the maximum Council Tax increase or to not implement all or any of the Adult Social Care precept would leave a large budget gap to be closed. Options for closing would then require a drawdown of limited reserves, or further savings on top of the already unprecedented one-year savings of £26m, leading to other issues such as cuts to services.

Relevance to the Corporate Plan and/or the Plymouth Plan

The development and approval of the annual budget and the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) is fundamentally linked to delivering the priorities within the Council's Corporate Plan. Allocating limited resources to key priorities will maximise the benefits to the residents of Plymouth.

Implications for the Medium Term Financial Plan and Resource Implications:

The resource implications are set out in the body of the report. The Government have assumed we will maximise both the Council tax increase and the Adult Social Care precept when referencing the Council's Core Spending Power.

Financial Risks

The Council is a complex service organisation with a gross revenue expenditure budget exceeding \pounds 500m, and faces significant financial risks given the continuing forecast shortfall, uncertainty about resourcing from central government, the wider economic environment and the Council's comparatively low levels of financial reserves. Each savings proposal carries its own risks, the mitigation for which will be explored as they are developed.

The Council is under a legal obligation to set a balanced budget for each municipal year, and the Council's Section 151 Officer is required to produce a statement as part of the budget documentation giving his view as to the robustness of the proposed budget.

Carbon Footprint (Environmental) Implications:

No impacts directly arising from this report. As proposals are developed and where relevant, an assessment of the carbon footprint implications of each decision/proposal

Other Implications: e.g. Health and Safety, Risk Management, Child Poverty:

The reducing revenue resources across the public sector has been identified as a key risk within our Strategic Risk register. As proposals are developed, officers will produce where relevant a risk register relating to the above areas specific to each proposal in order to inform decision making. The register will include mitigations of identified risks where necessary, and this will be reported as part of the decision-making process.

Appendices

Ref.	Title of Appendix	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applical If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indice why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 1 of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant b						indicate Jule 12A
		I	2	3	4	5	6	7
I	Movement from November 2022 Budget Report							
2	Additional Cost pressures and adjustments 2023/24							
3	Savings Proposals 2023/24 approved by Cabinet							
4	Indicative 2023/24 Directorate Budget							
5	Budget Engagement 2023/24 Results Report							
6	Budget 2023/24 Equality Impact Assessment							

Background papers:

*Add rows as required to box below

Please list all unpublished, background papers relevant to the decision in the table below. Background papers are <u>unpublished</u> works, relied on to a material extent in preparing the report, which disclose facts or matters on which the report or an important part of the work is based.

Title of any background paper(s)	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable) If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box.							
	I	2	3	4	5	6	7	
Budget 2023/24 – Draft Budget								
Draft Budget Report 2023-24 – Cabinet 10.11.22 and appendices								
Chelson Meadow Report – Cabinet 10.11.22 and appendices								
Parking Modernisation and Environmental Plan Report – Cabinet 10.11.22 and appendices								
Garden Waste Subscription Charge Report – Cabinet 10.11.22 and appendices								
Non-Commercial Bus Routes Options Report – Cabinet 10.11.22 and appendices								
Reinstatement of Charges for Non-Household waste at Recycling Centres- Delegated Decision 16.11.22and appendices								

OFFICIAL		Page 56			PL	PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL		
	Plymouth Habitat Banking Vehicle – Delegated Decision 8.11.22 and appendices							

Sign off:

Fin	pl.22. 23.3 41	Leg	EJ/3 8851/ 16.1. 23(2)	Mon Off	EJ/3 8851 /16.1 .23(2)	HR		Assets		Strat Proc	
Origina	ating Sen	ior Lead	ership Te	eam mer	mber: D	avid Noi	they (In	terim Ser	vice Dir	rector fo	r Finance)
Please	confirm	the Stra	tegic Dire	ector(s)	has agre	ed the re	eport? Ye	es			
Date a	greed: 16	6/01/202	3								
Cabine	Cabinet Member approval: Deputy Leader after discussion with Cabinet colleagues										
Date a	Date approved: 16/01/2023										

REVENUE BUDGET 2023/24 - Update

Introduction

- 1.1 This report provides an update on the latest position on the Council's budget for 2023/24, incorporating the impact of the December Provisional Settlement.
- 1.2 The Council continues to manage a challenging financial environment where service demands continue to increase, the longer-term legacy impact of COVID-19 continues and where uncertain and unpredictable funding and cost levels remain.
- 1.3 Together with all authorities the Council is in a serious and unprecedented position due to additional national and international factors largely beyond its control, including rapidly rising energy costs, broader inflation related cost increases and demand pressures and costs in both adults' and children's social care.
- 1.4 The Council's administration remains ambitious in its vision and objectives for the city and is committed in particular to ensuring that services to children, vulnerable adults and the provision of high value jobs continue to be key priorities.
- 1.5 This report will form part of the key budget papers that will be made available to the Budget Scrutiny meeting when it considers the draft budget proposals later this month.
- 1.6 The Council delivers more than 300 services as diverse as bin collections, protecting vulnerable children, providing libraries, making planning decisions, attracting investment and jobs in the city, providing leisure facilities, providing parking, maintaining roads and pavements and looking after Plymouth's parks and green spaces. Every part of the Council has been involved in the response to the budget situation and many employees and services will need to work in new ways. A significant amount of work continues to support the city's economy,

which has been severely affected by the recent pandemic and cost of living crisis: high value jobs remain a priority. It should be noted that options are limited by the fact that the Council needs to deliver a large number of services as a statutory requirement and has limited scope to influence how these services are delivered. Examples of this include supporting vulnerable children and adults in the city.

1.7 Despite these challenges, the City Council is ambitious for Plymouth and its residents and is keen to pursue its vision of making Plymouth a great place to live, work and visit. In doing so, listening to the views of city residents is a key part of the budget setting process and decision making.

Provisional Local Government Finance Settlement

- 2.1 On 19 December 2022, the Secretary of State for the Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities (DLUHC), Rt. Hon. Michael Gove MP, released a written statement to Parliament on the provisional local government finance settlement 2023/24. The Settlement held few surprises as the main areas had been trailed in both the Autumn Statement and a subsequent DLUHC briefing note. The Settlement is provisional; and issued for consultation; the consultation is open to submissions for 4 weeks from 19 December 2022 to 16 January 2023. The Council will respond and copy its response through the LGA (Local Government Association) which responds on behalf of the sector.
- 2.2 A summary of the key points from the Provisional Settlement are:
 - The referendum threshold for Council Tax as previously announced increases from the current 1.99% to the new 2.99% and councils can raise a further 2% through the Adult Social Care precept. These points were previously announced in the Autumn Statement.
 - For Business Rates, the government has changed the inflation measure used to increase the local government funding amount within the Settlement Funding Amount (SFA). CPI (Consumer Price Index) (September increase of 10.1%) has been used, instead of RPI (September increase of 12.6%). However, this has been tapered by the revaluation adjustment of the base values.
 - The Revenue Support Grant (RSG) remains and has been increased by 10.1% however existing grants have been subsumed into the amount allocated.
 - A new one-off Service Grant was created for 2022/23 only. The 2022/23 settlement announcement stated this one-off Service Grant was to provide funding to all tiers of local government in recognition of the vital services delivered at every level of local government. Although this has continued for a second year, it has been reduced. This reduction is due to the cancellation of the increase in National Insurance Contributions and to move funding to the Supporting Families programme.
 - The Lower Tier Services Grant (worth £111m nationally in 2022/23) has been removed and replaced by the Minimum Funding Guarantee of 3% for 2023/24.
 - Funding Guarantee This national £136m grant replaces the Lower Tier Services Grant. This grant is intended to provide a funding floor for all local authorities, so that no local authority would see an increase in Core Spending Power that is lower than 3% (before assumptions on council tax rate increases but includes those on Council Tax base).

- Nationally the Social Care Grant has increased by £1,506m to £3,852m. However, £161m of the increase is due to the roll-in of the Independent Living Fund. The "true" increase is £1,345m, which is funded from the postponement of adult social care charging reforms +£1,265m, and +£80m from other parts of the settlement.
- There is no change to the Improved Better Care Fund.
- The Market Sustainability and Fair Cost of Care Fund created in 2022/23 has been rolled into the Adult Social Care Market Sustainability and Improvement Fund. Of the £562m total funding, £162m has been rolled in from above, with an additional £400m intended for local authorities to make tangible improvements to adult social care, and to address discharge delays; social care waiting times; low fee rates; workforce pressures; and to promote technological innovation in the sector.
- There is a new Adult Social Care Discharge Fund with a £300m national grant for 2023/24 intended to form part of Better Care Fund plans, aimed at reducing delayed transfers of care, allocated on the basis of the improved Better Care Fund shares in used in 2023/24.
- 2.3 The implications of the provisional Settlement on the Council's resources for 2023/24 are set out in the relevant sections of this report. A movement summary from the November Cabinet Budget Report is set out in Appendix 1.

Budget Engagement

- 2.4 A public engagement to support the 2023/24 budget setting process took place between Friday II November and Sunday 04 December 2022. A questionnaire was developed which asked respondents to give their views on a range of budget savings / income proposals being put forward by the Administration to help inform the Council's budget setting for the 2023/24 fiscal year.
- 2.5 Some of the proposals in the November Cabinet report were not part of the engagement as work was being carried out to establish if some proposals could be brought forward to also help close the 22/23 funding gap. Where possible, those proposals will be subject to their own relevant statutory consultation and democratic processes.
- 2.6 307 online questionnaires were completed and entered for analysis and 17 emails were received with comments, ideas and suggestions. In addition, Plymouth's Youth Parliament took part in a face-to-face feedback event on 07 December and an online engagement with business representatives took place on 21 December 2022.
- 2.7 Participants were asked to provide comment on the proposals including the proposed increase of fees and charges associated with some council services. The numbers of responses received to individual proposals was low, therefore the views outlined in the report are not representative of the wider city population and results should be considered in this context.
- 2.8 A summary of the results shows:
 - Fees and Charges: while many respondents understood the need to increase fees and charges, the more negative comments tended to relate to fee increases for allotments and city centre parking charges. Respondents were generally in favour of charging for garden waste.
 - Children's Services: most responses to these proposals were positive with the largest responses relating to working with families to keep more children at home and reducing

the use of residential care, although there was concern about adequate safeguarding measures remaining in place.

- People Directorate: the largest responses related to managing demand on housing and adult social care and reviewing the sports development service.
- Customer and Corporate Services / Chief Executive Office: the largest responses related to reviewing Contact Centres / Customer Services and reducing the purchasing of library books with many responses to these proposals being positive those who agreed cited the need to seek efficiencies and cut costs. Some respondents stressed the importance of focusing on supporting older people and those who are not able to use digital services.
- Place Directorate: the proposal to consider a charge for the Park and Ride sites received 54 responses, the majority of which were positive. While a small charge was considered acceptable, a small number were concerned that people would not be able to afford the charge or would opt to drive into the city centre. The proposal to seek sponsorship for Bonfire Night or stop the event completely received the most responses, again with the majority being supportive.
- 2.9 Full details are contained within Appendix 5.

Revenue Budget

Council Tax

- 3.1 The Council Tax base for 2023/24 has been calculated at 74,891 properties, an increase of 1,061 on 2022/23. The Council Tax Base report for 2023/24 appears elsewhere on this Cabinet agenda and will be presented to Council in January 2023 for approval.
- 3.2 The rise in the tax base for 2023/24 primarily reflects the increase in the number of properties within the City. The assumed collection rate continues at 97.5%; this is realistic and prudent due to the current economic climate.
- 3.3 As set out above, the Provisional Settlement set the Council Tax referendum limit at 2.99% (i.e., this is the highest level of increase permissible without a referendum) and an adult social care precept (ASC) of 2.00%. For Plymouth, every quarter percent (0.25%) increase in the Council Tax would yield an additional £0.312m.
- 3.4 As part of developing the 2023/24 budget, Cabinet is advised that adopting a 2.99% increase for Council Tax and a 2.00% level of ASC precept is required in order to present a balanced budget. If adopted, these increases would provide an additional £3.740m in council tax and £2.500m adult social care precept; a total of £6.240m. The Government have assumed we will maximise this when referencing Council's Core Spending Power
- 3.5 The final decision on these matters will be taken at Full Council on 27 February 2023.

Business Rates

3.6 The CSR22 stated the multiplier for the calculation of Business Rates would be set at 0%, but with a Section 31 Grant to compensate for the resultant impact. As a result, the business rates grant income will increase by £4.347m in 2023/24. Taken together with £0.999m of growth in the base, this equates to a total increase of £5.346m from the current £65.130m to a revised £70.476m.

Revenue Support Grant (RSG)

3.7 The Provisional Settlement announced a RSG of ± 11.562 m. The increase is includes rolled in grants totalling ± 0.497 m. Excluding this the increase represents a CPI increase of 10.1% (± 1.020 m).

New Homes Bonus (NHB)

3.8 The allocation for New Homes Bonus payment in 2023/24 is £0.022m. This is £0.822m less than the forecast figure included in the budget report to Cabinet in November 2022. It reflects the Government changes which is now simply a one-year retrospective payment and is also due to the number of new homes being less than previously forecast. It should be noted this allocation settlement is for one year only and there is still no indication of what the replacement will be.

2022/23 Services Grant and Social Care Grant

- 3.9 Nationally, the Government has extended the grant to 2023/24 and Plymouth's allocation is £2.266m, a reduction of £1.755m. This reduction is due to the cancellation of the increase in National Insurance Contributions; to move funding to the Supporting Families programme and top-sliced to support the RSG growth.
- 3.10The Council also receives a Social Care Grant. The additional payment is £8.199m in 2023/24 but includes rolled in grants worth £0.582m so the net increase is £7.617m.
- 3.11 Plymouth City Council has been allocated a net £2.140m from the Government's Adult Social Care Market Sustainability and Improvement Fund. The Market Sustainability and Fair Cost of Care Fund created in 2022/23 has been rolled into this new grant. This is a ring-fenced grant intended for local authorities to make tangible improvements to adult social care, and, in particular, to address discharge delays; social care waiting times; low fee rates; workforce pressures; and to promote technological innovation in the sector.
- 3.12 There is a new Adult Social Care Discharge Fund with a 2023/24 £0.734m grant allocation for Plymouth, to form part of Better Care Fund plans, and is aimed at reducing delayed transfers of care.

Lower Tier Services Grant

3.13 The Government has announced the discontinuation of this grant (worth £0.416m in 2022/23). It has been replaced by the Minimum Funding Guarantee of 3% for 2023/24.

Public Health Grant

3.14 The Public Health grant is another key source of income and is used to improve the health of the population, and in particular to tackle large differences in health outcomes that we see between local areas. At the time of writing this report the 2023/24 grant has yet to be advised. The grant for 2022/23 is £15.940m and was announced in early Feb 2022.

Resources (Funding)

3.15 The total core resources available, incorporating the Settlement, and with and without a Council Tax increase and an Adult Social Care precept, are set out in the table below.

OFFICIAL

Page 61

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Resources (Funding)	2023/24 Draft Budget Cabinet Nov 2022 * £m	2023/24 No Council Tax increase and no ASC Precept £m	2023/24 with 2.99% increase in Council Tax / 2% Precept £m
Council Tax	(125.635)	(124.385)	(130.625)
Business Rates	(66.129)	(70.476)	(70.476)
Revenue Support Grant	(10.045)	(11.562)	(11.562)
Total Resources	(201.809)	(206.423)	(212.663)
Resources Required	213.203	213.280	213.280
Budget Balance	11.394	6.857	0.617

* Includes base growth and 1% ASC precept increase.

Directorate Spending Assumptions

- 3.16 A significant proportion of our revenue budget (circa 80%) is spent on two principal areas; adult social care services and children's social care provision. Nationally and locally the costs of providing health and wellbeing services are rising as demand and complexity increases. We have an ageing population and higher levels of young children requiring our services and the ongoing impact of COVID-19 on our cost base.
- 3.17 Adult Social Care supports over 4,700 people to meet their support needs in a range of settings, at home, within supported housing or residential and nursing care. Plymouth provides over 610,000 hours of care every year to help some of our most vulnerable residents in the city. During 22/23 the Council investigated over 1,700 referrals about the safety of adults.
- 3.18 The People budget in 2022/23 is £89 million in this area, but demand for services continues to rise due to a growing elderly population, the increasing complexity of the need following the COVID pandemic and in line with all areas increasing costs of care provision. However, the Council is committed to ensuring that there is care and support available for our most vulnerable adults and older people, through increased focus on reducing high-cost provision supporting more people to be healthy and well at home, engagement with care providers to reduce costs and further integration of support to deliver increased efficiencies.
- 3.19 The Council will continue to work in partnership with the NHS and other care and support providers to ensure services are more joined up and has been pioneering in combining our adult social care services with the community health services in Livewell Southwest as well as commissioning an Alliance to address complex health and housing needs in the city.
- 3.20 Nationally there has been significant pressures within Children's Services. A combination of increased numbers and increasingly complex cases has meant costs have been rising beyond the existing budget provision. Plymouth is responsible for ensuring children and young people are safe and protected from harm. This includes working with more than 2,177 children within its social care team.

- 3.21 Plymouth spends around £36 million on providing placements for children in care through foster carers, residential care and secure placements and services for children with special needs or a disability. There is also a range of services for children in children's centres, nurseries, and school transport and school places. The total budget on services for children in 2023/24 will be around £66 million.
- 3.22 Attention has been focused on early intervention and prevention to try to prevent children and young people needing to come into care and work closely with partners in health, schools and the police on this work.
- 3.23 This year Plymouth has witnessed increased pressures on budgets due to a small number of children entering into care with a high level of care needed and for some, an increase in the cost of care packages for children already in our care. The Council is determined to protect these vital services and is proposing to reduce costs by increasing the number of in-house foster carers we use, reducing the need for more expensive placements with external providers and supporting children to stay at home with their families or connected carers wherever possible.
- 3.24 The Place directorate has a net annual revenue budget of £27.3m (i.e., 14% of the Council's net revenue budget). Its Gross annual budget is £92.2m. It therefore has an income of £64.9m annually which is made up predominantly of grant and commercial income. The directorate has over the years significantly increased its income and reduced its net revenue spend significantly from £45m in 2013/14 to the current annual cost of £27.3m.
- 3.25 The Place directorate has three departments that carry out its work. These are Strategic Planning and Infrastructure (Strategic and development planning, housing, strategic transport schemes, public transport, climate change and green estate work), Economic Development (Regeneration, Economy and Enterprise, Commercial property, Freeport, National Marine Park, Culture, Events and Tourism) and finally Street Services (waste collection and disposals, street scene, trade and commercial waste, Highways, Parking and marine services). The majority of these services are universal services that benefit and interface with the lives all of residents, businesses and visitors to the city. However, the current financial challenges facing all businesses, individuals and councils have meant we have had to seek opportunities to address budgetary pressures and constraints.
- 3.26 Within Strategic Planning and Infrastructure, the reduced forecast spend in concessionary fares will be used to help address budgetary pressures. The costs of provision of non-commercial bus routes will be reviewed and options considered to maintain as many as possible, whilst at the same time looking to work within available budgets. The proposed introduction of charging at Park and Ride sites as part of ticketing for users of such sites will be introduced, meaning no increase to the cost of such facilities for park and ride customers. This will be subject to a further decision. A full review of Community Transport will be undertaken to ensure the efficient use of the limited available funding that is available. In areas where the city council currently contributes to partnership funded bodies, the level of investment will be reviewed and reduced, removed or alternate sources of funding sought to reduce pressures on PCC revenue. At the same time, the department will undertake a re-structure to deliver further savings.
- 3.27 The Economic Development department generates \pounds 24.7m income, covering the revenue costs of the overall economic development and includes projects grants for the Freeport, National Marine Mark, The Box and Property Regeneration fund and providing a surplus of \pounds 1.1m to wider council budgets. The Budget priority will be to continue to drive income. It will also continue to seek to reduce costs, increasing efficiency and further maximise grants to help support delivery of a council wide balanced net budget. A range of proposals are being developed that will reduce revenue costs through the capitalisation of staff costs, additional grant funding, seek cost neutrality in the running

of the Tourism Information Centre, seek new commercial income streams and Increase events sponsorship thereby reducing costs.

- 3.28 The Street Services department provides year-round statutory services to residents across the city. It will continue to strive to provide those services and keep the city in as best a shape as possible, maintaining facilities and activities such as the continued operation of Household Waste Recycling Centres in Weston Mill and Chelson Meadow as well as the provision of a variety of daily front line services. The department will seek to maximise efficiencies and reduce costs wherever possible e.g., through the re-profiling of city-wide street lighting and a re-prioritisation of Highways maintenance; as well as maximising income in areas such as Highways Engineering client fees. It will seek to increase efficiency in the waste collection routes and services which collect 117,000 waste bins from residents every week. Reviews of charging for parking which have not changed since 2017 and Resident Permits, which have not changed since 2007, are proposed for implementing and charging introduced across a variety of waste service activities. This will include the introduction of an annual fee for the non-statutory service of garden waste collections as approved by Cabinet at its meeting of the 10 November 2022
- 3.29 The Customer & Corporate Services directorate has a net annual revenue budget of £45 two core objectives; supporting the organisation and delivering customer services. Core services include but are not limited to: finance, procurement, insurance, Human Resources, facilities management and our Customer and Digital service (business support, libraries, information governance).
- 3.30 During 2022/23, as part of the Council's Transformation Programme, the directorate has delivered a new business support service, introduced new ways of working, reduced our office accommodation, delivered the Council's new website and won awards for our digital inclusion network.
- 3.31 Looking forward and to support the delivery of our savings in 2023/24 our efforts will be focused on the Customer Service Strategy, ensuring the most vulnerable and digitally excluded have choice in how to access our services, consult on our front doors and libraries, improve our processes supported by automation where we can, refocus DELT, maximise our assets, deliver our people strategy and drive organisational change as well as considering how best to deliver our corporate services in the future.
- 3.32 Business Support is a vital component that underpins critical activities right across the Council, both in front line delivery as well as in our corporate functions. It is supported by the Council's Transformation Programme and will support the delivery of savings as it maximises opportunities to streamline, simplify and deliver services digitally.
- 3.33 The Chief Executive's office manages a net annual revenue budget of just under £5.4m, or just under 3% of the Council's total net revenue budget. Income, at over £0.500m is made up of a combination of services provided for other public bodies, grants and charges made for services specific to projects, such as legal support for capital schemes. Through a combination of increasing chargeable activity for other public bodies and the introduction of multi-disciplinary teams, the service has reduced its revenue requirement from the Council by over £0.700m since 2013/14.
- 3.34 The Chief Executive's service covers four main areas of work. The oversight and governance team provides support for the Council's democratic functions, including Members' support and all the Council's decision making, covering Cabinet, Scrutiny, and all other decision-making bodies. The team also provides and supports the Council's performance and risk framework, responsible

for the provision, reporting and analysis of our delivery of services to the public and the management and reporting of strategic and operational risk.

- 3.35 The Legal service provides services to all the directorates, ranging from commercial, litigation, and property related support to child and adult protection and the Council's Monitoring Officer responsibilities. We have plans to further minimise the amount of legal support that the Council commissions externally through greater provision from our own expertise, and tighter scoping of legal requirements.
- 3.36 The Communications team is responsible for the Council's external and internal communications arrangements and our relationships with external stakeholders. The elections and registration team manages the city's electoral register and delivers local and national elections. With significant changes in voter identification being implemented through the recent Elections Act, the team will be ensuring that additional burdens funding from the government will meet the inevitable extra costs incurred in successful implementation of new responsibilities in this area.

Additional Costs

- 3.37 The estimated additional budget costs for 2023/24 are set out in Appendix 2. These include;
 - Cost and volume increases for Adults' and Children's Services
 - Net cost and volume increased allocation for Homelessness.
 - Covering the Council's commitment to the National Living Wage for our adult social care providers, and ensuring they receive the necessary funding
 - Additional corporate costs covering salary increases and pension provision.
 - The cost of financing the Capital Programme.
 - Place Directorate specific pressures as a direct result of Covid covering reduced car park income and additional domestic waste collection costs.
 - Energy and fuel cost pressures as a result of increases to the cost of gas, electricity and fuel. These cost rises impact street lighting plus the crematoria and Life Centre as examples.
- 3.38 The draft budget in November preceded the Autumn Statement announcement confirming the National Living Wage to take effect from April 2023. The original proposal included an allocation to care providers taking the increased rate from the current £9.50 to the forecasted £9.97. The Chancellor confirmed the new rate would be £10.42, meaning a further allocation of £3.300m is required, as shown in Appendix 2.
- 3.39 Further one-off adjustments to the cost base have also been identified totalling £0.633m, covering concessionary fares and capital funding in the Place Directorate (a net adjustment of £0.133m) and facilities management within the Corporate and Customer Services Directorate £0.500m. These are shown in Appendix 2.

Savings Plans

3.40 Savings plans totalling £26.166m were presented in detail at Cabinet on 10 November 2022. This comprised directorate savings of £21.413m and corporate, or council wide savings of a further £4.753m. This corporate figure included a fees and charges estimate of £0.760m which has been adjusted downwards by £0.367m following detailed analysis. This gives an overall revised savings total of £25.799m and the proposals for each Directorate (including both those requiring further decisions) are shown in Appendix 3.

Closing the Budget Gap

- 4.1 A budget gap of £11.394m was presented to Cabinet on 10 November 2022. As a result of the provisional finance settlement and other updates to the budget and the proposed council tax and precept increase, the gap now stands at £0.617m. Officers will provide an update to covering this shortfall at the February Cabinet. A final balanced budget will be recommended to Full Council at the end of February 2023.
- 4.2 Full details of the movement from the November budget report are set out in Appendix I.
- 4.3 The current position of the 2023/24 Budget now comprises:

Area	2023/24 Draft Budget Cabinet Nov 2022 £m	2023/24 Revisions £m	2022/23 Updated Budget £m
Additional Resources	(4.059)	(10.854)	(14.913)
Right Sizing the Budget	15.680	0.500	16.180
Additional Costs – Corporate	13.965	(4.855)	9.110
Additional Costs - Directorates	11.974	4.065	16.039
Savings – Corporate	(4.360)	0.367	(3.993)
Savings - Directorate	(21.806)	0.000	(21.806)
Budget Gap	11.394		0.617

Conclusion

- 4.4 This report sets out the remaining budget gap after the application of a Council Tax and precept increase which is proposed to be approved at Full Council on 27 February 2023.
- 4.5 To get to this position, Cabinet Members and Officers have: incorporated the impact of the Provisional Settlement as the Final Settlement has not yet been notified; it is not expected that this will result in any or significant variation.
- 4.6 Cabinet are therefore being asked to recommend to Council to approve a budget position that will require it to adopt
 - A Council Tax increase of two point nine nine percent (2.99%)
 - An Adult Social Care Precept increase of two percent (2.00%)

Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP)

- 5.1 As part of developing the 2023/24 budget future years have been considered and modelled in the following table. This includes the full year effect of savings proposals introduced in 2023/24 and the ongoing pressures within all services.
- 5.2 For purposes of modelling only, for 2024/25 through 2026/27 Council Tax has been shown at the current referendum threshold limits. Attention is drawn to the ongoing forecast shortfalls in resources and the Council is already considering means of achieving balance in those years.

General Fund Budget	2023/24	2024/25
	£m	£m
Resources	(212.663)	(216.767)
2022/23 Base Budget Costs	197.750	
2023/24 Base Budget Costs		213.280
Additional Costs	49.528	14.484
Grant Funding	(8.199)	0.000
Savings	(25.799)	0.000
Shortfall	0.617	10.997

Note: It should be noted that when the shortfall in 2023/24 of $\pounds 0.617m$ is met a commensurate adjustment will apply to the shortfall in 2024/25 to a revised $\pounds 10.380m$.

5.3 Moving forward the MTFP will be closely monitored to take account of proposals emerging from Government policy and Council initiatives as they become available to mitigate the shortfall. The full impact of the 2023/24 additional costs and savings, plus estimates of grant funding need full analysis.

Equality & Diversity

- 6.1 The Equality Act (2010) harmonised and replaced pre-existing equality legislation and extended statutory protection across nine 'protected' characteristics. It recognised forms of discrimination that were previously beyond the scope of legislation and introduced the concept of the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED).
- 6.2 The protected characteristics include; age, disability, gender reassignment marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation. The PSED placed specific responsibilities on public sector organisations to consider equality in their decision making. It consists of a general equality duty, supported by specific duties. In summary, those subject to the equality duty must have due regard to the need to:
 - Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other prohibited conduct.
 - Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic, and those who do not.
 - Promote good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
 - 6.3 Plymouth City Council is committed to equality and diversity and to ensuring that the decisions we take promote equality. To help inform the development of the Council's budget and to

ensure that we give 'due regard' to equality during this process, we are considering the equality implications of our budget decisions. A completed equality impact assessment will be presented with the final budget paper.

6.4 Alongside the overarching budget EIA (Equality Impact Assessment), separate assessments will be completed on individual decisions as they go through the decision-making cycle.

Appendix I

	2023/24
	£m
November Cabinet Report – gap	11.394
Business Rates multiplier	(4.347)
Revenue Support Grant (RSG)	(1.517)
Local Council Tax Support Grant (subsumed into RSG)	0.395
Additional Social Care Grant	(8.199)
Independent Living Fund (subsumed into Social Care Grant)	0.582
Lower Tier Grant - Abolished	0.416
Services Grant – reduction	1.755
New Homes Bonus (allocation = £22k v forecast £0.850m)	0.828
National Living Wage further increase to revised £10.42	3.300
Cost and income assumptions adjustments – income	0.367
Cost and income assumptions adjustments - costs	0.633
Revised post Settlement	5.607
Additional 1% ASC Precept *	(1.250)
Additional Council Tax 2.99%	(3.740)
Revised post Council Tax increase	0.617

* The £11.394m gap includes a 1% ASC precept increase.

Appendix 2

Net additional cost pressures and adjustments

Right Sizing the Budget	£m
Additional 2022/23 pay award consolidated into the 2023/24 budget	2.900
One off in 2022/23 COVID 19 Additional Grant Income	4.890
One Offs in 2022/23 budget	6.123
Other Budgets funded from one off allocations in 22/23 consolidated into the base for 23/24	2.267
Total Right Sizing the Budget Costs *	16.180

* Includes cost that will be allocated to Directorates

Corporate Items	£m
Energy pressures Hard FM (Facilities Management)	3.265
Energy pressures - Street Lighting	1.000
Energy pressures – Leisure facilities	0.500
Salary Increases 2023/24	3.800
Financing the Capital Programme	1.670
Interest and other TM pressures	2.550
PFI (Private Finance Initiative) contract	0.273
Lower Tier Grant	0.416
Services Grant	1.755
Local Council Tax Support Grant (rolled into Revenue Support Grant)	0.395
New Homes Bonus (NHB)	1.685
Social Care Grant	(8.199)
Total Corporate Costs	9.110

Children	
	£m
Social care provision – Additional cost and volume of placements	3.053
Short breaks	0.370
Home to school Transport	1.000
	4.423

People	£m
Adult Social Care – Care Packages	1.700
National Living Wage	5.300
Homelessness Cost and volume	1.000
Independent Living Fund (Now in Social Care Grant)	0.582
	8.582

Place	£m
Staffing - Streets	0.627
Vehicle fuel	0.446
Parking - 50% of legacy shortfall	0.450
Reversing one off income in 22/23	0.183
Waste tonnage and additional costs	0.628
Grounds maintenance	0.700
	3.034

Total Directorate Costs 16.039

Appendix 3 Savings Proposals

Corporate	2023/24
	£m
One Offs found for 23/24	(2.493)
Reduction in Corporate Budgets	(1.500)
	(3.993)

Summary of Savings by Directorate	
	£m
Children	(4.575)
People	(6.030)
ODPH (Office of the Director of Public Health)	(0.292)
Place	(7.290)
Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services	(3.619)
	(21.806)

Children	
	£m
Work with families to keep more children at home	(1.627)
Reduce the use of residential care, increase the use of foster care and work to ensure	
children in care can return to their families or a connected person in their lives	(2.275)
Review our workforce / organisational structure. Realigning services in Targeted Support and Social Care will reduce the need for agency workers and costs associated with external assessments	(0.673)
	(4.575)

People	
	£m
Managing demand in homelessness	(0.500)
Managing and reducing cost pressures across care provider market	(1.000)
18-64 Review Programme and Reducing Transition Packages	(0.430)
Managing and Reducing Demand of ASC Packages (65plus)	(1.000)
Review Reablement Service, realising efficiencies through improved ways of working.	(0.250)
Review Early Help provision and Children's centres in partnership with Children's	
Directorate and partners across the city	(0.600)
Review Sports Development service and align function to Plymouth Active Leisure	(0.043)
Review Youth Services working in partnership with local providers to reduce costs.	
	(0.100)
Transfer funding for Health and Wellbeing Hubs to Public Health Grant removing cost from	
People Directorate budget	(0.119)
Maximise Grants to support wellbeing services	(0.508)

Ellion I	
Review contracts to deliver efficiencies in partnership with Providers	(0.205)
Maximise Disabled Facilities Grant to support the provision of community equipment and	
adaptations in peoples' homes.	(0.500)
Develop a new operating model across the directorate	(0.200)
Increase Houses of Multiple Occupation licensing fee	(0.075)
Use £250k reserve to support range of children's services	(0.250)
Reduce Council subsidy associated with Leisure facilities.	
Tinside Lido: broaden offer including new events	
Plympton Pool: review operating costs and income	
Mount Wise Pools: Implement entry charge to contribute to costs of running	
Brickfields: develop community sports and wellbeing hub with partners	
	(0.250)
	(6.030)

ODPH	2023/24
	£m
Maximisation of grants across ODPH	(0.250)
Increased Fees & Charges income	(0.042)
	(0.292)

Place	2023/24
Reduce Concessionary Fares Budget - release underspends in this budget assessed against	£m
historic trends	(0.500)
Increase car parking charges as per Cabinet decision of 10 November 2022	(0.934)
Charging for collection of garden waste (councils are not required to provide garden waste collections as it is a non-statutory service) As per Cabinet decision on 10 November 2022	(0.530)
Re-instate charging for non-household waste at Household Waste Recycling Centres (Asbestos, soil, rubble, plasterboard)	(0.177)
Re-instate charging for bin delivery	(0.032)
Reduce budget for supporting non-commercial bus routes and implement charges at Park and Ride sites to support the city's bus network	(0.229)
Generate savings and income from the commercial estate (lease renewals, re-gearing and new income)	(0.343)
Capitalisation of Strategic Project Teams costs	(0.050)
Review costs of the Economic Development Team through capitalisation of costs, efficiencies, income and sponsorship targets	(0.077)
Secure new and additional income and grants from cultural trusts and foundations	(0.125)
Ensure Tourist Information Centre is cost neutral	(0.025)
Seek sponsor for Bonfire Night on The Hoe or stop the event.	(0.030)
Review of Community Transport provision including release of bike hire underspend, consideration of funding underspends, the optimisation of services and identifying alternative	
funding models.	(0.070)
Withdraw from Devon and Cornwall Rail Partnership	(0.010)
Withdraw from South Hams/Plymouth Urban Fringe Team	(0.066)
Reduce/re-align financial contributions to environment/marine bodies	(0.010)
Increase Allotment income	(0.011)
Undertake a full-service re-structure of Strategic Planning & Infrastructure	(0.300)

	H CITT COUNC
Annual increase in parking fees and identify new forms of income	(0.423)
Highways Engineering Client Fees through capitalisation of back-office support	(0.128)
Re-profile Highways Maintenance in areas such as white-lining, gulley work, barriers and	
ironworks as well as rationalising staffing and seeking capitalisation of back-office costs	(0.500)
Route optimisation savings of refuse collection service	(0.290)
Increase fees and charges in Street Services in line with fees and charges policy – areas	
include commercial, trade and bulky waste, MOTs, marine, playing pitches and beach huts	(0.234)
Reduce street lighting costs by investing in a new computer management system that helps	
reduce energy costs	(0.500)
Strategic Contract Optimisation	(0.430)
Introduce new Chelson Meadow Solar Farm to support energy savings	(0.050)
In line with national government policy, create a habitat banking scheme to generate income	
from developments to improve biodiversity and offset environmental impact	(0.029)
Maximise nature-based solutions to create additional income	(0.020)
One off saving – Reduce Foreshore Reserve	(0.129)
One off saving – Reduce Park and Ride Reserve	(0.100)
One off saving – Reduce Bad Debt Provision	(0.343)
One off saving - Strategic Projects License Fee	(0.048)
Utilise funding allocated for food waste collection service pending Government guidance on	
next steps for introduction	(0.200)
Recovery of owed land receipts	(0.050)
Increased Fees & Charges income	(0.296)
	(7.290)

Customer & Corporate Services	2023/24
Customer & Corporate Services	£m
Review Contact Centres/Customer Services operating within the Council to look at broader efficiencies, bringing services together and focusing on those who are not able to use digital	
services and the most vulnerable communities we serve	(0.188)
Reduce purchasing of library books as eBook loans are increasing	(0.050)
Cease Local Government Information Unit (LGIU) and Key Cities subscriptions	(0.021)
Swap revenue budget funding for Community Grants programme with capital funding which	
is available	(0.213)
Share policy and performance functions across the Council	
	(0.084)
Bring together marketing, design and communications functions across the Council	
	(0.080)
Reduce external legal advice	(0.020)
Review Lord Mayor's events and streamline resources	(0.030)
Review senior management resource across the Council	(0.200)
One-off proposal to freeze the Head of Policy and Regional Partnerships role for 23/24	(0.070)
Improve processes and implement automation technology to reduce manual work in	
Business Support	(0.200)
Consult residents on how the Council re-provisions its Library Service alongside a review of other community buildings and services.	Subject to consultation – likely to be 24/25 saving

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Introduce a plan to save money on IT as part of review of how services are best delivered	
across the Council	(0.600)
Freeze vacancies from Transformation and Digital teams and identify funding sources	(0.300)
Reduce spending on agency staff used in managing council buildings	(0.060)
Adjust security provision in council buildings	(0.123)
Reduce posts within the Human Resources Organisational Development (HROD) service	
	(0.220)
Review learning and development spend across the Council	(0.025)
Review of audit requirements from the Devon Audit Partnership	(0.050)
Review budget for the Finance team	(0.250)
Reduce external financial advice	(0.050)
Vacate Windsor House earlier than planned	(0.500)
Accelerate transfer of Children, Young People and Families service from Midland House and	× *
sell the building	(0.230)
Increased Fees & Charges income	0.055)
	(3.619)

(21.806

		••				0
	В	Budget 22/23 Bu		Budget 22/23		/24
Directorate	Expenditure	Income	Net Budget	Cost Increases	Savings/ Income	Net Budget
Corporate	11.783	(50.891)	(39.108)	25.290	(3.993)	(17.811)
Children	151.478	(89.316)	62.162	4.423	(4.575)	62.010
People	132.561	(37.403)	95.158	8.582	(6.030)	97.710
ODPH	20.553	(20.861)	(0.308)	0.000	(0.292)	(0.600)
Place	92.162	(64.884)	27.278	3.034	(7.290)	23.022
Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services	121.971	(69.403)	52.568	0.000	(3.619)	48.949
	530.508	(332.758)	197.750	41.329	(25.799)	213.280
				Total Resou available	rces	(212.663)
				Budget Sh	ortfall	0.617

Appendix 4 Indicative 2023/24 Directorate Budget

BUDGET ENGAGEMENT 2023-24 INTRODUCTION

A public engagement to support the 2023-24 budget setting process took place between Friday II November and Sunday 04 December 2022. A questionnaire was developed which asked respondents to give their views on a range of budget savings / income proposals being put forward by the Administration to balance the Council's budget for the 2023-24 fiscal year.

- 307 online questionnaires were completed and entered for analysis.
- 17 emails were received with comments, ideas and suggestions (these were included in the overall analysis).
- In addition, Plymouth's Youth Parliament took part in a face-to-face feedback event on 07 December and an online engagement with business representatives took place on 21 December 2022.

The results of all engagement activity will be considered by the Council's Cabinet and will also be submitted as part of the budget scrutiny process undertaken by Plymouth City Council Members in January 2023.

Some of the proposals in the November Cabinet report were not part of the engagement as work was being carried out to establish if some proposals could be brought forward to also help close the 22/23 funding gap. Where possible, those proposals will be subject to their own relevant statutory consultation and democratic processes.

METHODOLOGY AND COMMUNICATION

A questionnaire was developed which asked respondents to give their views on 67 savings and income generating proposals being put forward by each of the Council's Directorates, including a question regarding the proposed increase of fees and charges associated with some council services. The proposals were grouped to ensure the questionnaire was kept to a reasonable length for respondents and to assist in the analysis of comments. The final question asked respondents to provide suggestions and idea of other ways to make savings or generate income that may not have already been considered. There were 14 questions in total.

The questionnaire was available online through Plymouth City Council's consultation portal and available in other formats upon request.

A communications plan was developed which set out the required materials, branding and opportunities for advertising and promoting the engagement.

The engagement exercise was promoted in the local media and through the Council's own channels; social media, Plymouth Newsroom, resident e-newsletter and direct messaging to stakeholders.

Appendix A of this report provides an overview of how many people responded and the demographics of those respondents.

Comments were analysed separately for each proposal. Some respondents chose to comment on all proposals whereas others opted to comment only on specific areas. Therefore, the number of responses to each proposal varies. Only comments which specifically mentioned or responded to the proposals were included in the analysis.

It should be noted that the number of responses to individual proposals is relatively small therefore the results should be treated with caution, and views outlined in the report may not be representative of the city.

SECTION | – FEES AND CHARGES

Question I asked respondents to comment on the proposal being put forward in relation to the Council's fees and charges. There are several services that Plymouth City Council provides that are subject to additional charges. Some of the fees and charges are set nationally and cannot change. However, for those fees and charges where a local rate can be set, the Fees and Charges policy allows an annual uplift of fees by the rate of inflation. There is also further flexibility around changing the rates throughout the year.

As the cost of delivering many of our services has increased by up to 20 per cent, the Council's Cabinet agreed on 10 November 2022 that fees and charges should be increased; this includes charges for building control, allotments, venue hire, highway permits and parking.

As the initial increase will not close the funding gap for delivering the services and whilst inflationary pressures continue, the question asked respondents to consider and feedback views on the proposal that a further 10 per cent increase, where practical, be introduced on 01 April 2023.

200 comments were received in relation to increasing the Council's fees and charges and of these, 65 made comments unrelated to the proposal leaving 135 for analysis. 50 were supportive of the proposal to increase fees and charges while 50 were not supportive and 35 were categorised as neutral.

Respondents were generally in favour of charging for garden waste although there were some concerns about an increase in fly tipping. A small number of respondents voiced concerns around increasing fees for allotments and also charging more for city centre parking as this could reduce footfall, these concerns were mainly in repect of the wider cost of living increases. A few respondents suggested targeting any additional increases to avoid additional costs to vulnerable people or to certain services only. Example comments in relation to increasing fees and charges include;

"You need to increase charges in order to keep services going."

"I would rather pay more, than lose vital services."

"Not warranted at this time when so many are struggling. Stop wasting money instead"

"Surely a 30% rise in parking fees will have a major impact on footfall in the town centre and elsewhere, and will encourage parking in residential areas where you cannot yellow line."

Some respondents were of the opinion that the proposal was to increase Council Tax rather than fees and charges – where this was the case the comments were excluded from the analysis as they were not related to the proposal.

SECTION 2 – CHILDREN'S SERVICES

There are three proposals being put forward for Children's Services bridging the gap by £4.575m.

2.1 Proposals I - 3

Proposal I: Work with families to keep more children at home

Proposal 2: Reduce the use of residential care, increase the use of foster care and work to ensure children in care can return to their families or a connected person in their lives

Proposal 3: Review our workforce / organisational structure. Realigning services in Targeted Support and Social Care will reduce the need for agency workers and costs associated with external assessments

Question 2 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 160 responses were received in total to this question:

- 78 were received for proposal 1 42 positive, 9 negative and 27 neutral
- 83 were received for proposal 2 49 positive, 10 negative and 24 neutral
- 51 were received for proposal 3 32 positive, 8 negative and 11 neutral

For **Proposals I and 2**, the majority of the neutral or negative comments referred to safeguarding concerns as there were worries that any changes to services could mean that children were left in settings that were unsafe. With **Proposal 2**, several respondents raised concerns over whether there would be sufficient numbers of foster carers and also around the cost of foster care meaning that this proposal could not be realised.

There were very few specific comments for **Proposal 3**, but where respondents did comment, there was general agreement that reducing use of agency staff would be a positive move.

A selection of sample comments include:

"In order to keep children at home with families, the council needs to invest more in more early help and targeted support, such as in Children's Centres and Family Hubs, not reduce this funding. It also needs to adequately remunerate and support foster carers and relatives who care for children, many of whom have additional needs."

"You need to ensure C&YP are safe, many are not safe at home. Be cautious of being neglectful, this could cost more in the long run as well as costing some child their life. Where will you get the foster carer provision? There's a dire shortage in Plymouth."

"Provided safety isn't jeopardised then effective savings will have to be made."

SECTION 3 – PEOPLE DIRECTORATE

There are 12 proposals being put forward for the People Directorate, with savings or income bridging the gap by \pounds 5.955m.

3.1 Proposals I - 5

Proposal I: Manage and reduce demand on housing and adult social care

Proposal 2: Review Reablement service

Proposal 3: Review early help provision and children's centres in partnership with Children's Directorate and partners across the city

Proposal 4: Review sports development service and align function to Plymouth Active Leisure

Proposal 5: Review youth services working in partnership with local providers to reduce costs

Question 3 asked respondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 150 responses were received in total to this question:

- 41 were received for proposal 1 16 positive, 22 negative and 3 neutral
- 26 were received for proposal 2 16 positive, 9 negative and 1 neutral
- 31 were received for proposal 3 17 positive, 12 negative and 2 neutral

- 40 were received for proposal 4 25 positive, 14 negative and 1 neutral
- 30 were received for proposal 5 17 positive, 11 negative and 2 neutral

For **Proposals I, 2 and 3** the majority of comments centred on concerns around service capacity and future demand for services. There were worries that any changes to services could result in increased numbers of people without access to appropriate housing and/or adult social care provision. Where there were positive commentes for proposals 2 and 3, these tended to focus on an appreciation that these decisions were nessecary to reduce the Council's costs.

On **Proposals 4 and 5**, comments both positive and negative tended to focus on the key role that youth services and sport play in the local community. A large proportion of respondents commented that the lack of detail included in these proposals hampered their ability to provide a response.

A selection of sample comments include:

"I agree to all five reviews with a definite view to cutting costs in the proposal number four"

"None of these will work either because there are insufficient services already..."

"...Think long term and [about] the welfare of the people in order to create a better person with healthier mental health that will be successful in the future."

"Proposals 1-5 seem to produce as saving and seem reasonable."

3.2 Proposals 6 - 11

Proposal 6: Transfer funding for health and wellbeing hubs to Public Health

Proposal 7: Maximise grants to support wellbeing services

Proposal 8: Review contracts to deliver efficiencies

Proposal 9: Maximise Disabled Facilities Grant

Proposal 10: Develop a new operating model across the directorate

Proposal II: Use reserve to support range of children's services

Question 4 asked respondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 58 responses were received in total to this question:

- 21 were received for proposal 6 16 positive, 3 negative and 2 neutral
- 21 were received for proposal 7 17 positive, 2 negative and 2 neutral
- 24 were received for proposal 8 17 positive, 5 negative and 2 neutral
- 25 were received for proposal 9 19 positive, 2 negative and 4 neutral
- 22 were received for proposal 10 18 positive, 2 negative and 2 neutral
- 24 were received for proposal 11 19 positive, 3 negative and 2 neutral

There were very few comments made specifically about **Proposal 6.** Where comments were made, they tended to be positive and cite the reasonable nature of the proposals. For **Proposals 7, 8 and 9** comments were broadly positive and respondents expressed that they were keen for the Council to maximise its income. Where respondents did comment on **Proposal 11**, these tended to be cautiously positive though some respondents queried the sustainability of the approach.

A selection of sample comments include:

"...these seem appropriate."

"Yes, need to maximise other income and also use it to cover gaps."

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

"Maximising grants and reviewing contracts are logical steps to achieving cost savings. Using the reserve should be a last resort as it can just delay difficult future decisions for a limited period of time."

3.3 Proposal 12

Proposal 12: Reduce Council subsidy associated with leisure facilities:

- I2A Tinside Lido: Broaden offer including new events
- 12B Plympton Pool: Review operating costs and income
- I2C Mount Wise Pools: Implement entry charge to contribute to costs of running
- **I2D Brickfields:** Develop community sports and wellbeing hub with partners

Question 5 asked respondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 62 responses were received in total to this question:

- 30 were received for proposal I2A 24 positive, 4 negative and 2 neutral
- 37 were received for proposal 12B 26 positive, 8 negative and 3 neutral
- 43 were received for proposal I2C 28 positive, II negative and 4 neutral
- 28 were received for proposal I2D 24 positive, 3 negative and I neutral

For **Proposal 12**, respondents tended to be positive. They focused on the important role that swimming pools play in supporting people to have healthy lifestyles. Numerous respondents commented that they would be prepared to pay more to access facilities if they were better maintained. Others commented that in the current economic climate, any increases in fees may discourage use and push these facilities out of reach for some residents. Several comments were made in support of broadening the offer at Tinside and, the importance of partnership working.

A selection of sample comments include:

"Sports facilities need to be kept. Plympton pool is an important part of the community, and I personally would be prepared to pay more to keep it."

"Sports are essential for wellbeing. These should not be cut. The Hoe and Mt Wise, which are in full view of visitors to the city, need to be maintained to a high standard."

"I would support this in theory as long as any price increases passed onto users are proportionate and don't preclude people from being able to access leisure facilities."

SECTION 4 - CUSTOMER AND CORPORATE SERVICES/CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICE

There are 22 proposals being put forward for Customer and Corporate Services and the Chief Executive Office, with savings or income bridging the gap by \pounds 3.543m.

4.1 Proposals I – 3

Proposal I: Review Contact Centres/Customer Services operating within the Council to look at broader efficiencies, bringing services together and focusing on those who are not able to use digital services and the most vulnerable communities we serve

Proposal 2: Reduce purchasing of library books as ebook loans are increasing

Proposal 3: Swap revenue budget funding for Community Grants programme with capital funding which is available

Question 6 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 127 comments were received in total to this question, and of these, 25 made comments unrelated to the proposals leaving 102 for analysis.

- 70 were received for proposal 1 45 positive, 5 negative and 20 neutral
- 78 were received for proposal 2 43 positive, 16 negative and 19 neutral
- 47 were received for proposal 3 39 positive, 2 negative and 6 neutral

Of those respondents who provided a comment for **Proposal I**, where hese were positive many also cited the need to seek efficiencies and cut costs. However, there were a number of comments that also stressed the importance of focusing on supporting older people and those who are not able to use digital services. The majority of the neutral or negative comments referred to the need for continued face to face and telephone contact or extending contact hours.

A selection of sample comments include:

"Contact should be with a person only, no bots/message/chats".

"Totally agree with this proposal. I feel that the older generation still need that extra support."

"The elderly and those digitally not connected or needing extra support need face to face. Offering a limited service ie short hours a couple of times a week would enable access for all in the contact centre. Perhaps change it to Ballard House if not wanting to maintain the current contact centre so maximising use of space/time".

"Very important to always focus on those who are digitally excluded for whatever reason. A civilised, trauma informed city does not leave its most vulnerable people behind in quest for 'efficiencies' or 'progress'".

Of those respondents who provided a specific response to **Proposal 2**, over half were in support, while the most of neutral and negative comments raised concerns that not everyone has access to computers / e-readers, in particular older people. **Proposal 2** also gave rise to a number of comments relating to the provision or reduction of library services more generally. These comments will be forwarded to the relevant department for consideration if the proposal to consult residents on how the Council re-provides its Library Service is agreed.

A selection of sample comments include:

"2. Would seem sensible to reduce number of books with increased use of e books, maybe supporting people to purchase and use kindles?"

"Library books are quite old fashioned nowadays".

"While I and many like me read digital books the importance of libraries and library books for the elderly or lonely cannot be overstated".

"These need to be carefully reviewed as not everyone has access to computers / e-readers etc. Libraries are part of the community and cannot be replaced digitally".

Of those respondents who commented on **Proposal 3** the majority were in favour of the proposal. Those who did not agree or were neutral cited concerns around whether this capital funding would be to similar levels and cover the same scope. Several respondents felt that they were unable to comment on this proposal.

A selection of sample comments include:

"Please keep Community Grants - local communities see tangible benefits - getting capital funding seems sensible as long as it doesn't reduce the scope".

"With regards to proposal 3 - this is a good idea, however is this funding the similar / above / less - things already don't work well in Plymouth will this change make it better or worse".

4.2 Proposals 4 - 9

OFFICIAL

Page 82

- **Proposal 4**: Share policy and performance functions across the Council
- Proposal 5: Bring together marketing, design and communications functions across the Council
- Proposal 6: Reduce external legal advice
- Proposal 7: Review Lord Mayor's events and streamline resources
- Proposal 8: Review senior management resource across the Council

Proposal 9: One-off proposal to freeze the Head of Policy and Regional Partnerships role for 2023/24

Question 7 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 72 comments were received in total to this question, and of these, 14 made comments unrelated to the proposals leaving 58 for analysis.

- 33 were received for proposal 4 33 positive, 0 negative and 0 neutral
- 35 were received for proposal 5 33 positive, 0 negative and 2 neutral
- 37 were received for proposal 6 33 positive, 0 negative and 4 neutral
- 43 were received for proposal 7 42 positive, I negative and 0 neutral
- 46 were received for proposal 8 46 positive, 0 negative and 0 neutral
- 32 were received for proposal 9 31 positive, 0 negative and 1 neutral

Those respondents who commented on **Proposals 4 - 9** provided mainly positive responses. **Proposals 7 and 8** received the most responses citing high levels of support. On **Proposal 7** some respondents went further suggesting reviewing the necessity for a Lord Mayor. On **Proposal 12** comments emphasised the need to review or reduce senior management and, in some cases, middle management, including reviewing senior management salaries and benefits.

A selection of sample comments include:

"Most of these proposals are efficiency savings, which I agree with".

"All similar functions across the council should be brought together to reduce unnecessary costs and duplication."

"Drastically reduce senior management and can we get rid of the Lord Mayor completely, what is the point in the 21st century".

"I am pleased to see this proposal listed. Too often organisations fail to fully include senior management in staffing resources reviews".

"I'm very much in favour of Proposal 6 (reducing external legal advice) except where absolutely necessary. The legal officers on the strength of the council should be dealing with all but very few issues. Other proposals certainly worthy of consideration."

4.3 Proposals 10 - 14

Proposal 10: Improve processes and implement automation technology to reduce manual work in Business Support

Proposal II: Consult residents on how the Council re-provides its Library Service alongside a review of other community buildings and services

Proposal 12: Introduce a plan to save money on IT as part of review of how services are best delivered across the Council

Proposal 13: Freeze vacancies from transformation and digital teams and identify funding sources

Proposal 14: Reduce spending on agency staff used in managing Council buildings

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Question 8 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 74 comments were received in total to this question, and of these, 13 made comments unrelated to the proposals leaving 61 for analysis.

- 32 were received for proposal 10 27 positive, 2 negative and 3 neutral
- 39 were received for proposal 11 31 positive, 1 negative and 7 neutral
- 33 were received for proposal 12 28 positive, 0 negative and 5 neutral
- 32 were received for proposal 13 27 positive, 2 negative and 4 neutral
- 27 were received for proposal 14 26 positive, 0 negative and 1 neutral

Those respondents who commented on **Proposals 10 - 14** provided mainly positive responses. However, while some respondents to **Proposal 11** commented that they agreed with consulting residents on how the Council re-provides its library services, the proposal also gave rise to a number of comments relating to the provision or reduction of library services more generally and some respondents chose this question to make the case for either closing or keeping library services. These comments will be forwarded to the relevant department for consideration if **Proposal 11** is agreed and taken forward.

Several respondents commented on the interdependencies between **Proposals 10, 12 and 13** in terms of the impact of freezing transformation and digital vacancies and implementing plans to make IT savings whilst at the same time proposing to improve processes and implement automation technology.

While responses to **Proposal 14** were mainly positive, the comments suggest that in many cases respondents were agreeing with reducing agency staff across the whole Council rather than specifically in relation to agency staff managing council buildings.

A selection of sample comments include:

"These proposals appear generally sensible. Use of IT/automation technology is likely to be essential to achieve greater efficiencies..."

"Seems reasonable to review these - glad any proposed changes to library services would have a consultation."

"Consulting residents on how the Council re-provides its Library Service alongside a review of other community buildings and services is a very good point, they should be considered in every way necessary."

"Freezing the digital vacancies at the same time as increasing automation seems like a mistake. But digital and automated solutions instead of business support is appropriate - recently applying for parking permits felt very manual. Too much free text on forms makes for lots of manual processing!"

"All of the above (10-14). With specific focus on reducing agency staff across ALL council departments."

4.4 Proposals 15 - 22

Proposal 15: Adjust security provision in Council buildings

Proposal 16: Reduce posts within the Human Resources Organisational Development (HROD) service

Proposal 17: Review learning and development spend across the Council

Proposal 18: Review of audit requirements from the Devon Audit Partnership

Proposal 19: Review budget for the Finance team

Proposal 20: Reduce external financial advice

Proposal 21: Vacate Windsor House earlier than planned

Proposal 22: Accelerate transfer of Children, Young People and Families service from Midland House and sell the building

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Question 9 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 66 comments were received in total to this question, and of these, 9 made comments unrelated to the proposals leaving 47 for analysis.

- 25 were received for proposal 15 24 positive, 1 negative and 4 neutral
- 32 were received for proposal 16 26 positive, 3 negative and 3 neutral
- 30 were received for proposal 17 25 positive, 3 negative and 2 neutral
- 27 were received for proposal 18 26 positive, 0 negative and 1 neutral
- 28 were received for proposal 19 27 positive, 1 negative and 0 neutral
- 32 were received for proposal 20 30 positive, 0 negative and 2 neutral
- 37 were received for proposal 21 34 positive, 0 negative and 3 neutral
- 33 were received for proposal 22 29 positive, 2 negative and 3 neutral

Those respondents who provided a comment on **Proposals 15 - 22** gave mainly positive responses. Some of the responses to **Proposals 15, 16 and 18** cited the need to ensure a risk based approach is taken for any changes or reduction in these areas. Those respondents who disagreed with **Proposal 22** cited that children and families should be the priority for the council.

A selection of sample comments include:

"I agree to all but one proposal. Re proposal 22, children, young people and families must be given 100% support and their welfare given total priority."

"These proposals seem sensible."

"Sell off unneeded buildings. Provide security for less buildings but of the correct nature."

"15&16: Reducing and adjusting spending on security and HR will again be a short sighted vision that may end up costing PCC (Plymouth City Council) more. What happens if an employee is assaulted at work and the lack of security contributed to it? What happens when a serious matter needs to be addressed by HR but the demand on them is so great they all leave and you can't recruit into post?"

"Proposal 20, Why get expensive external advice when the in-house teams are perfectly capable of making these decisions. Proposal 21, very good idea, can the premises not be rented out to generate more income for the council?"

In general, of those respondents who provided a comment to the proposals under the Customer and Corporate Services / Chief Executive's section, there was broad agreement with the proposals relating to back office support functions and the use of buildings and accommodation.

SECTION 5 – PLACE DIRECTORATE

There are 29 proposals being put forward for the Place Directorate, with savings or income bridging the gap by \pounds 4.82m.

5.1 Proposals I – 8

Proposal I: Reduce concessionary fares budget - release underspends in this budget assessed against historic trends

Proposal 2: Consider and consult upon the implementation of charges at Park and Ride sites to support the non-commercial bus routes and contribute to savings already identified in the separate Cabinet report agreed on 10 November 2022

Proposal 3: Generate savings and income from the commercial estate (lease renewals, re-gearing and new income)

Proposal 4: Capitalisation of Strategic Project Team costs

Proposal 5: Review costs of the economic development team through capitalisation of costs, efficiencies, income and sponsorship targets

Proposal 6: Secure new and additional income and grants from cultural trusts and foundations

Proposal 7: Ensure Tourist Information Centre is cost neutral

Proposal 8: Seek sponsor for Bonfire Night on The Hoe or stop the event

Question 10 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 139 responses were received to this section in total. Most of the feedback in this section related to proposals 1, 2 and 8 so analysis was concentrated on these proposals.

29 responses were received to **Proposal I** with the majority (24) being in favour. Three were negative and two were neutral. Several respondents were not clear that this proposal was to release the overspend rather than reduce or remove concessionary fares themselves and commented more generally on which fares should remain concessionary. Any comments not directly related to the proposal itself were excluded from the analysis.

54 responses were received to **Proposal 2** with 31 being positive, 20 negative and 3 neutral. Whilst many respondents felt that a small charge was broadly acceptable, a few respondents raised concerns that residents may not be able to afford additional charges or that any charge would increase the number of people travelling by car into the city centre.

"Increased charges for parking etc will disproportionately affect the poorest in the community trying to remain independent."

"I agree with this proposal, as it is vital to provide funding for the non-commercial bus routes to avoid communities being cut off. It is fair to spread the cost between the many hundreds of Park and Ride users."

"Making a small charge for Park and Ride seems sensible to support other bus services, but you need to make sure it's actually cheaper than driving into the city centre, even for more passengers."

83 responses were received to **Proposal 8**. The majority (73) were positive with 4 negative and 6 neutral. There appears to be strong support for seeking sponsorship or cancelling Bonfire Night on The Hoe. Those who supported the proposal were either not in favour of the event (i.e., consider it noisy, disruptive or not good for the environment) or believed the council should not be funding an event such as this when services are being cut elsewhere.

"Stop the bonfire night save the money and give wildlife and animals a break."

"Agree re proposal 8 - cancel - unsustainable in the present climate."

"Stopping the fireworks will only encourage people to run their own firework display which is bound to increase injuries and lead to possible conflict in areas. It's much safer on the Hoe."

5.2 Proposals 9 - 15

Proposal 9: Review of community transport provision including release of bike hire underspend, consideration of funding underspends, the optimisation of services and identifying alternative funding models

Proposal 10: Withdraw from Devon and Cornwall Rail Partnership

Proposal II: Withdraw from South Hams/Plymouth Urban Fringe Team

Proposal 12: Reduce/re-align financial contributions to environment/marine bodies

Proposal 13: Increase allotment fees

Proposal 14: Undertake a full-service re-structure of Strategic Planning and Infrastructure

Proposal 15: Annual increase in parking fees and identify new forms of income (subject to consultation as required), in addition to those savings already identified in the separate Cabinet report agreed on 10 November 2022

Question 11 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 87 responses were received to this section overall. The majority of feedback in this section related to proposals 13 and 15 therefore analysis was concentrated on these proposals.

40 responses were received to **Proposal 13** with 18 being positive, 19 being negative and 3 neutral. Those in favour of this proposal only indicated their agreement and no detailed comments were made. Of those against the increase in allotment fees, there were concerns that this was an unfair increase and could potentially have a negative impact on health and cost of living pressures for those that use the allotments. This view was mirrored in the fees and charges section.

"13. Disagree. Gardening improves health and provides healthy low-cost veggies for people without gardens."

"Proposal 13 yes definitely raise fees."

"Is there any impact assessment of increasing allotment fees? These are hugely important to many people in providing food and in health & wellbeing. Would not want to see people being priced out."

47 responses were received to **Proposal 15** with 17 being positive, 22 negative and 8 neutral. Where respondents indicated support for this proposal, very few specific comments were made. Those not in favour raised concerns about the cost being unaffordable with the current cost of living pressures. A few respondents also raised concerns that this will reduce footfall in the city centre and have a negative impact on local businesses.

"Proposal 15: obviously required, but there is a need to ensure it is comparable to similar cities/towns in the southwest. Too high increases are very likely to be detrimental to many businesses in Plymouth."

"If you increase parking charges, this will reduce city centre footfall. Provide an alternative to the car i.e., cheap, clean & frequent public transport."

"Plymouth city centre will just die if you increase parking charges. Businesses will close and you will lose business rates. Many more people will go to out-of-town shopping centres or order online."

"Agree proposal 15 as long as increase is fair and reasonable."

5.3 Proposals 16 - 21

Proposal 16: Highways engineering client fees through capitalisation of back-office support

Proposal 17: Re-profile highways maintenance in areas such as white-lining, gulley work, barriers and ironworks as well as rationalise staffing and seek capitalisation of back-office costs

Proposal 18: Make route optimisation savings in refuse collection service

Proposal 19: Increase fees and charges in Street Services in line with fees and charges policy – areas include commercial, trade and bulky waste, MOTs, marine, playing pitches and beach huts

Proposal 20: Strategic contract optimisation

Proposal 21: Introduce new Chelson Meadow solar farm to generate savings (post feasibility works)

Question 12 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 77 responses were received to this section overall. The majority of feedback in this section related to proposals 17, 18, 19 and 21 therefore analysis was concentrated on these proposals. Several

respondents commented that they did not know enough or there was not enough information for them to form an opinion.

25 responses were received for **Proposal 17** with 17 being positive, 4 negative and 4 neutral. No themes emerged strongly from the comments, only general support for the proposal.

22 responses were received for **Proposal 18** with the majority (19) being positive, 1 negative and 2 neutral. No specific themes emerged from the feedback received.

27 responses were received to **Proposal 19** with 18 being positive, 3 negative and 6 neutral. The few respondents not in favour of the proposal were generally concerned about increases in waste charges and the potential for an increase in fly tipping. Also, a couple of respondents were not in favour of the increase in charges for playing pitches.

"Proposals seem ok generally but re. 19, beware unintended consequences - increase in waste charges will lead to more fly tipping, increases in charges for playing pitches may reduce demand, health etc."

"Proposal 19 needs to be thought through carefully for waste so that it does not cause an increase in flytipping."

"Would not want to see increases to fees in playing pitches without impacts on those who use them being fully assesses. These are an important source of community cohesion, health and wellbeing etc."

41 responses were received to **Proposal 21** with the majority (36) being positive, 2 negative and 3 neutral.

"The solar farm is an excellent idea. Can this be done anywhere else?"

"Yes! Chelson Meadow solar farm! Wind, wave and solar community projects? Help Plymouth to become more self-sufficient and benefit from the unique location we are in. Encouraging people to look after their city and themselves will reduce costs."

"Agree with all of the above, although I'd question the actual capital expenditure on the solar farm. Is this a project that could be delayed, and the funds better used elsewhere for now?"

5.4 Proposals 22 - 29

Proposal 22: In line with national government policy, create a habitat banking scheme to generate income from developments to improve biodiversity and offset environmental impact

Proposal 23: Maximise nature-based solutions to create additional income

Proposal 24: One off saving - reduce foreshore reserve

Proposal 25: One off saving - reduce Park and Ride reserve

Proposal 26: One off saving - reduce bad debt provision

Proposal 27: One off saving - Strategic Project Team licence fee

Proposal 28: Utilise funding allocated for food waste collection service pending Government guidance on next steps for introduction

Proposal 29: Recovery of owed land receipts

Question 13 asked repondents to comment generally or more specifically on the proposals outlined above. 49 responses were received to this section overall. The majority of feedback in this section related to proposals 22 and 28 therefore analysis was concentrated on these proposals. A number of respondents to this section commented that they did not know enough or there was not enough information for them to form an opinion.

22 responses were received to **Proposal 22** with 20 being positive and 2 being neutral and requesting more information.

"Anything encouraging more sustainable development should be implemented as a good investment in our future (22 and 23). If this saves us money, then even better!"

"Yes, maximise nature-based solutions. Is there additional funding/sponsorship for projects which protect the environment?"

18 responses were received to **Proposal 28** with the majority (16) being positive and 2 negative.

"Agree we are the only area that does not undertake food waste. But only if cost effective and costs are made back."

"On 28, food waste collection, there should be ways to offer this cost neutral, through sale of composted material or partnership working."

No strong themes emerged from the comments to either proposal.

SECTION 6 – FURTHER IDEAS/SUGGESTIONS

Question 14 asked participants to give any further ideas to help generate savings or increase income to the council. Of the 307 respondents, 223 took this opportunity to provide further comment. Half of respondents suggested savings, a quarter suggested ideas for income generation and a quarter had other suggestions.

Generate Savings (113 respondents)

Within the suggestions put forward for generating savings, 3 main themes emerged:

- Taking management actions such as reviewing staff numbers, working more efficiently and reviewing employee benefits
- Reducing current service provision
- Ceasing the regeneration of the city

The most common responses to generate savings centred on management actions such as reviewing staff numbers, working more efficiently and reviewing employee benefits. This included reducing both the number of Councillors and the number of elections and the reduction of senior management and staff salaries (37). This was very closely followed (35) by suggestions that the Council and its staff should work more efficiently both in its systems and workforce. This ranged from the way in which services are commissioned to getting staff back into the office. In terms of reducing current service provision theme, this included comments about withdrawing from the Devon & Cornwall Rail Partnership, cutting bus provision, turning off streetlights at night and closing libraries.

Increase Income (56 respondents)

Within the suggestions proposed for increasing income, 5 main themes emerged:

- Utilise Council assets/services to generate income
- Introduce and increase fees and charges
- Ask central Government for more money
- Find corporate funding for events/put on more events
- Better use of enforcement

Of these, the most popular theme of 'utilise Council assets/services to generate income' generated 22 comments. These ranged from the use of 'Crowd Funding' and considering a Council lottery to

introducing car parking charges at Park and Ride sites, Mount Batten, Jennycliff and Devil's Point. Also suggested was the selling off parcels of land and advertising on the side of refuse trucks. The next most common theme was 'introduce and/or increase fees and charges', which generated 15 comments. The comments ranged from 'introducing a congestion charge for motorists' to 'asking students to pay council tax', and from 'charging for visits to the Box' and 'asking passengers to contribute towards their concessionary bus journeys'.

'Other' suggestions (54)

Within the "Other" suggestions, comments were themed into 3 main areas:

- Comments that were likely to be a complaint, in particular about Armada Way
- Not an actual savings or income proposal
- Already doing these proposals

Many of the comments were specifically complaining about the regeneration of Armada Way or a specific topic. In relation to suggestions that were neither income nor savings related, these tended to be comments or statements covering a wide range of issues including comments about keeping services running.

SECTION 8 - YOUTH PARLIAMENT ENGAGEMENT

A budget engagement event on the 07 December 2022 with Plymouth's Youth Parliament explored the current situation and the savings and income options proposed. Young people were offered the opportunity to put forward suggestions for alternative savings and potential income generation and a wide range of topics were discussed, from the electrification of fleet vehicles to bringing back commissioned services into Council control. Some of the group had already responded to the online budget engagement. Some specific feedback from the session included:

- Acknowledgement that cuts do consider the environment but concerned how that continues to be a focus when the Council has such a big deficit. Reminder that the Council is committed to the green agenda.
- Could the Council consider re-buying businesses that they have previously sold off to generate some income. The example used was whether the Council could buy back contracts from bus companies (such as Stagecoach and CityBus) to help generate money from (some) bus routes.
- Acknowledge that some services are statutory and need to be maintained/continued but asked how this can be balanced?
- When looking at cuts to social care there was an acknowledgement that some services have to continue young people get a sense staff are leaving Council due to not being valued and/or recognised for the work they do. How can we ensure this is done?
- Agree need to replace agency staff with Council employees because costs of agency staffing are too high and causing a lot of the issues need to look at workforce we have, skills and availability and role they undertake.
- Long term care and residential placements are not great, and their cost is an issue. How can the Council ensure value for money and best care for those young people?

SECTION 9 – BUSINESS ENGAGEMENT

A meeting was held on 21 December 2022 with several of the City's key business group representatives.

Groups and organisations represented include:

• Devon and Plymouth Chamber

- Destination Plymouth
- Plymouth Growth Board
- Plymouth Business Improvement Districts (BIDs)
- Plymouth Federation of Small Businesses (FSB)
- Plymouth Social Enterprise Network

The budget issues were outlined and, with recognition of these, representatives shared their thinking on the way forward regarding economic development in the city. This was well received, and the Chair of the FSB wrote to Plymouth City Council in response to this session to recognise the achievements of the Economic Development Team to date, despite some of the challenges currently being faced.

Appendix – Demographic Breakdown

Total	324
Additional comments via email	17
Online questionnaires submitted	307

The following demographic information has been compiled from the total number of questionnaires analysed (307).

Age

Age	Number	%
25 - 34 yrs.	20	6.5%
35 - 44 yrs.	29	9.4%
45 - 54 yrs.	52	16.9%
55 - 64 yrs.	73	23.8%
65 - 74 yrs.	74	24.1%
75 - 84 yrs.	32	10.4%
85 or over	2	0.7%
Prefer not to say	13	4.2%
(blank)	12	3.9%
Total	307	100.0%

Sex

Sex	Number	%
Female	93	30.3%
Male	74	24.1%
Prefer not to say	22	7.2%
(blank)	118	38.4%
Total	307	100.0%

Gender identity - same as the sex registered at birth

Gender ID	Number	%
No	I	0.3%
Prefer not to say	23	7.5%
Yes	164	53.4%
(blank)	119	38.8%
Total	307	100.0%

Disability – day to day activities

Disability	Number	%
No	107	34.9%
Prefer not to say	21	6.8%
Yes, limited a little	36	11.7%
Yes, limited a lot	24	7.8%
(blank)	119	38.8%
Total	307	100.0%

Ethnicity

Ethnicity	Number	%
Asian or Asian British	2	0.7%
Different ethnic group	2	0.7%
White	171	55.7%
(blank)	132	43.0%
Total	307	100.0%

Veterans - previously served in the UK Armed Forces

Veterans	Number	%
No	135	44.0%
Prefer not to say	21	6.8%
Yes	19	6.2%
(blank)	132	43.0%
Total	307	100.0%

APPENDIX 6: EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT – BUDGET 2023/24

Author(s): This is the person completing the EIA template.	Laura Hill	Department and service:	Policy and Intelligence Team, Executive Office	Date of assessment:	09/12/2022 (Last updated 16/01/2023)
Lead Officer: Please note that a Head of Service, Service Director, or Strategic Director must approve the EIA.	David Northey, Service Director for Finance	Signature:		Approval date:	
Overview:	than the equality impacts from The exception to this is where the Community Grants progra have been assessed and where below. EIAs will be completed for ind with the Council's standard de and put in place mitigation act It should be noted that it is antic papers are finalised for final put Context In February, the Council's ann to deliver a legally required ba increase, the longer-term impacost levels remain.	ipated that numbers included wit blication. ual budget for 2023/24 is being lanced budget in a challenging act of COVID-19 continues to budget, 67 savings plans totalli	sions that may be taken as par dget reductions that relate to a assionary Fares budget proposive been identified, these have b as they are developed and bro EIAs will assess the potential is thin this EIA will change as the b g presented to Cabinet. The b financial environment where s be felt and where uncertain a	t of the budget s specific activity, al. These budget been included in ought forward in impacts of indivi- udget is develope udget paper sets service demands and unpredictable	setting process. for example, proposals the table accordance dual decisions d and budget s out the plans continue to e funding and

- People £6.030m
- ODPH £0.292m
- Place £7.290m
- Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services £3.619

Public engagement to support the 2023/24 budget setting process took place between 11 November and 04 December 2022. People were invited to provide their feedback on the proposals and suggest other ideas for saving money. The results of this engagement have been analysed and have been used to inform the development of this EIA.

Although socioeconomic background is not a protected characteristic, it is important to place this year's budget setting process in the wider socioeconomic context. Whilst our most recent City Survey suggests that 77 per cent of residents agree that Plymouth is a great place to live and over 60 per cent have pride in their local area and also feel as though they belong, this is a challenging time economically for residents and service users. Many are experiencing increased financial and wellbeing pressures from the rising cost of living and the same survey showed that 21 per cent of people agreed that the food they buy doesn't last and they don't have money to get more.

The social and economic impacts of the rising cost of living are felt differently across the social strata but they should not be underestimated. The 2019 Index of Multiple Deprivation highlighted that of the 317 local authority districts in England, Plymouth is ranked as the 64th most deprived. For those people in some of the city's most deprived wards, the rising cost of living places them in an increasingly uncertain financial position which will only worsen inequality in the city.

Council Tax

As part of developing the 2023/24 budget, Council have the option to adopt a 2.99 per cent increase for Council Tax and a 2 per cent level of Adult Social Care precept as part of the budget setting process. If adopted, these increases would provide an additional £3.740m in council tax and £2.500m adult social care precept; a total of £6.240m.

The Council Tax base for 2023/24 has been assumed at 74,891 properties, an increase of 1,061 on 2022/23. The Council Tax Base report for 2023/24 will be presented to Cabinet for consideration in January 2023 and will then be presented to Council for approval.

Analysis of the current council tax support caseload was undertaken to assess whether there may be an indirect impact on one or more groups with protected characteristics as a result of any possible council tax rises. This data is included where it is available in the evidence for each protected characteristic below. Plymouth City Council currently operates a council tax support scheme which limits the amount eligible recipients have to pay to up to 20 per cent. In addition, an exceptional hardship policy exists to support those in financial need.

Impacts and mitigation
The impacts from the Council's budget decisions are likely to be felt by people with protected characteristics. These
impacts will primarily be felt by younger and older people and, those with disabilities. Those already in precarious
financial positions or with multiple vulnerabilities may also feel some impacts.

Protected characteristics (Equality Act, 2010)	Evidence and information (e.g. data and consultation feedback) Where available, the latest census 2021 data has been included.	Adverse impact	Mitigation activities, timescale and responsible department
Age	 Plymouth 16.4 per cent of people in Plymouth are children aged under 15. 65.1 per cent are adults aged 15 to 64. 18.5 percent are adults aged 65 and over. 2.4 percent of the resident population are 85 and over. South West 15.9 per cent of people are aged 0 to 14, 61.8 per cent are aged 15 to 64. 22.3 per cent are aged 65 and over. England 17.4 per cent of people are aged 0 to 14. 64.2 per cent of people are aged 15 to 64. 18.4 per cent of people are aged 15 to 64. 18.4 per cent of people are aged 65 and over. (Data sourced from the 2021 Census) 	A reduction in the budget for Children's Services may disproportionally negatively impact children and care experienced young people. As, due to the nature of the service, young people are overrepresented within the service. A reduction in the budget for People may disproportionally negatively impact older people. As, due to the nature of the service, older people are overrepresented within the service. A reduction in the budget for Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services may disproportionally negatively impact older people. For example, some older people may find accessing online information and resources more challenging when compared to the wider population. The proportion of young people and older people receiving Council Tax Support suggests that there could be an adverse impact on these groups from any increases in	ElAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process. Plymouth City Council currently operates a council tax support scheme which limits the amount eligible recipients have to pay to up to 20 per cent. In addition, an exceptional hardship policy exists to support those in financial need. The concessionary fares budget will be closely monitored going forward. It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.

	 Claimants by Council Tax Support caseload: 2.68 per cent of claimants are aged 18 to 24. 14.19 per cent of claimants are aged 25 to 34. 17.46 per cent of claimants are aged 35 to 44. 15.75 per cent of claimants are aged 45 to 54. 16.29 per cent of claimants are aged 55 to 64. 15.43 per cent of claimants are aged 65 to 74. 18.20 per cent of claimants are aged 75+. 31.37 per cent of Council Tax Support claimants have children. 99 per cent of adults aged 16 to 44 years in the UK were recent internet users in 2019, compared with 54 per cent of adults aged 75 years and over (Data sourced from ONS 2021) On 31 March 2022, Plymouth had 491 children in care. A further 184 young people (care experienced aged 18 to 20) were supported by our Care Leavers Team. Families with three or more children and single parent families are disproportionately likely to be amongst low income groups. 	Council Tax. Any impacts are likely to be exacerbated due to rising living costs. A reduction in the Concessionary Fares budget may disproportionally negatively impact older people. As, due to the nature of the budget, older people are overrepresented as beneficiaries. A reduction in the Community Grants programme budget may negatively impact both older and younger people. As, due to the nature of the programme, community grants have supported youth groups and projects which have brought older people together to combat social isolation.	
Disability	10 per cent of our population have their day-	A reduction in the budget for People may	EIAs will be completed as budget
	today activities limited a lot by a long-term	disproportionally negatively impact people	proposals develop and are brought
	health problem or disability (2011 Census).	with disabilities. As, due to the nature of the	forward. Where appropriate mitigations

National evidence suggests that a higher	service, adults with disabilities are	and timeframes will be identified as part	
proportion of individuals who live in families	overrepresented within the service.	of that process.	
with disabled members live in poverty,	A reduction in the budget for Children's		
compared to individuals who live in families	Services may disproportionally negatively	Plymouth City Council currently	
where no one is disabled (EHRC 2017).	impact young people and children with	operates a council tax support scheme	
After housing costs, the proportion of	disabilities. As, due to the nature of the	which limits the amount eligible	
working age people with disabilities living in	service, young people and children with	recipients have to pay to up to 20 per	
poverty (26 per cent) is higher than the	disabilities are beneficiaries and more likely to	cent. In addition, an exceptional	
proportion of working age non-disabled	engage with this service.	hardship policy exists to support those	
people (20 per cent) (Scope, 2020).	A reduction in the budget for Place may	in financial need.	
41.56 per cent of Council Tax Support	disproportionally negatively impact people	The concessionary fares budget will be	
claimants have some form of disabled	with disabilities. For example, some people	closely monitored going forward.	
premium indicator.	with disabilities are more reliant on community-based initiatives such as		
In 2019, adults with disabilities (aged 16 years	community transport.	The concessionary fares budget will be	
and over) in England made 757 trips on		closely monitored going forward.	Page
average per person per year, compared to 1,016 for adults without a disability (DFT	A reduction in the budget for Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate	It may not be possible to fully mitigate	ge
Accessibility Statistics; 2020)	Services may disproportionally negatively	the adverse impact from the	ő
Accessionity Statistics, 2020	impact older people. For example, some	Community Grants programme	97
	people with disabilities may find accessing	proposal if there is no longer capacity to	
	online information and resources more	make revenue funds available for it.	
	challenging when compared to the wider		
	population.		
	The proportion of disabled people receiving Council Tax Support suggests that there		
	could be an adverse impact on this group		
	from any increases in Council Tax. Any		
	impacts are likely to be exacerbated due to		
	rising living costs.		
	A reduction in the Concessionary Fares		
	budget may disproportionally negatively		
	impact people with disabilities. As, due to the		
	nature of the budget, people with disabilities		
	are overrepresented as beneficiaries.		

		A reduction in the Community Grants Scheme budget may negatively impact people with disabilities. As, due to the nature of the programme, community grants have supported a number of groups and projects which engage with people with disabilities.	
Gender reassignment	There are no official estimates for gender reassignment at either national or local level (awaiting 2021 Census data). There is extensive research to show that people who identify as LGBT+ are more likely to experience poor mental health in	A reduction in the budget for People and Children's Services may disproportionally negatively impact trans and non-binary individuals, for example if resources for outreach and engagement are limited.	EIAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process.
	general (Intercom, 2020). 0.5 per cent of residents in Plymouth have a gender identity that is different from their sex registered at birth. 0.1 per cent of residents identify as a trans man, 0.1 per cent identify as non-binary and, 0.1 per cent identify as a trans women.	A reduction in the Community Grants programme budget may negatively impact the LGBT+ community. As, due to the nature of the programme, community grants have supported groups and projects which engage with the LGBT+ community.	It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.
Marriage and civil partnership	 40.1 per cent of residents have never married and never registered a civil partnership. 10 per cent are divorced, 6 percent are widowed, with 2.5 per cent are separated but still married. 0.49 per cent of residents are, or were, married or in a civil partnerships of the same 	A reduction in the budget for Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services may disproportionally negatively impact people who wish to get married or form a civil partnership, for example if resources are more limited.	EIAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process.
Pregnancy and maternity	sex. 0.06 per cent of residents are in a civil partnerships with the opposite sex. The total fertility rate (TFR) for England was 1.62 children per woman in 2021. The total	A reduction in the budget for People and Children's Services may disproportionally negatively impact pregnant women. As, within	EIAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations

	fertility rate (TFR) for Plymouth in 2021 was 1.5.	society women are overrepresented within childcare and care giving roles, which could mean that they are more likely to engage with these Council services including Children Centres. A reduction in the Community Grants programme budget may negatively impact pregnant women. As, due to the nature of the programme, community grants have supported groups and projects which engage with pregnant women specifically.	and timeframes will be identified as part of that process. It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.
Race	 In 2021, 94.9 per cent of Plymouth's population identified their ethnicity as White, 2.3 per cent as Asian and 1.1 per cent as Black. People with a mixed ethnic background comprised 1.8 per cent of the population. I per cent of the population use a different term to describe their ethnicity. 92.7 per cent of residents speak English as their main language. 2021 Census data shows that after English, Polish, Romanian, Chinese, Portuguese, and Arabic are the most spoken languages in Plymouth. Evidence suggests that minority ethnic communities have disproportionately felt the economic impacts of the rising cost of living. 	A reduction in the budget for People and Children's Services may disproportionally negatively impact people from minority ethnic backgrounds if culturally sensitive service provision is not possible within proposed resources. A reduction in the budget for Place and Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services may disproportionally negatively impact people from minority ethnic backgrounds if there are not resources to provide varied and culturally aware events and a civic offering. In addition, reductions in the People budget could result in limitations on the ability to provide culturally sensitive community services.	ElAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process.
Religion or belief	48.9 per cent of the Plymouth population stated they had no religion. 42.5 per cent of the population identified as Christian (2021 Census).	A reduction in the budget for Place and Chief Executives and Customer and Corporate Services could disproportionally negatively impact people from faith backgrounds if there	EIAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process.

	Those who identified as Muslim account for 1.3 per cent of Plymouth's population while Hindu, Buddhist, Jewish or Sikh combined totalled less than 1 per cent (2021 Census).	are not resources to provide varied and culturally aware events and a civic offering. In addition, reductions in the People budget could result in limitations on the ability to provide culturally aware services. A reduction in the Community Grants Programme budget negatively impact faith communities. The programme guidance for councillors suggests that funds may be used to assist projects that benefit religious groups where the project will bring wider community benefit.	It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.
Sex	 51 per cent of our population are women and 49 per cent are men (2021 Census). Young women between the ages of 16 and 24 have a higher risk of common mental health conditions. 92.99 per cent of Council Tax Support claimants who are single parents headed by a female. 	A reduction in the budget for People and Children's Services may disproportionally	ElAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process. Plymouth City Council currently operates a council tax support scheme which limits the amount eligible recipients have to pay to up to 20 per cent. In addition, an exceptional hardship policy exists to support those in financial need.
Sexual orientation	88.95 per cent of residents aged 16 years and over in Plymouth describe their sexual orientation as straight or heterosexual. 2.06 per cent describe their sexuality as bisexual, 1.97 per cent of people describe their sexual orientation as gay or lesbian. 0.42 per cent of	A reduction in the budget for People and Children's Services may disproportionally negatively impact the LGB community if service capacity is reduced and outreach to these communities is no longer possible.	ElAs will be completed as budget proposals develop and are brought forward. Where appropriate mitigations and timeframes will be identified as part of that process.

residents describe their sexual orientation using a different term. There is extensive research to show that people who identify as LGBT+ are more likely to experience poor mental health in general (Intercom, 2020)	programme budget may negatively impact the LGBT+ community. As, due to the nature of the programme, community grants have	It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.
---	---	---

SECTION FOUR: HUMAN RIGHTS IMPLICATIONS

Human Rights	Implications	Mitigation Actions	Timescale and responsible department
	If there are any Human Rights implications from the 2023/23 budget, these will be identified when proposals are brought forward, and an EIA is completed at that point. It is not possible to assess human rights implications within this EIA due to its high-level nature.	EIAs will be completed as budget pr brought forward. Where appropria will be identified as part of that pro	te mitigations and timeframes

SECTION FIVE: OUR EQUALITY OBJECTIVES

Equality objectives	Implications	Mitigation Actions	Timescale and responsible department
Celebrate diversity and ensure that Plymouth is a welcoming city.	committed to celebrating the diversity of the city. However, the ability of local	mitigate the adverse impact from	Not applicable.

	through local events and activities may be reduced if the Community Grants Scheme budget is reduced.	longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.	
Pay equality for women, and staff with disabilities in our workforce.	Plymouth City Council is committed to promoting equality and the fair treatment of its workforce. As an employer, we have a clear policy of paying employees equally for the same or equivalent work regardless of gender or disability. The Council operates a comprehensive job evaluation scheme to ensure that rates of pay are fair and are based wholly on the role being undertaken.	Where budget proposals are likely to impact on the workforce, an EIA will be completed, and consultation will be carried out where required.	HROD.
Supporting our workforce through the implementation of Our People Strategy 2020 – 2024	Our People Strategy 2020 – 2024 sets out our approach towards ensuring that the Council's workforce can adapt and meet the ever-changing needs of the Council and our residents.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.
Supporting victims of hate crime so they feel confident to report incidents, and working with, and through our partner organisations to achieve positive outcomes.	The Council is committed to reducing and tacking hate crime and ensuring that victims are treated in a trauma informed manner to ensure that they get the outcome which is most appropriate for them. The Council works closely with the Safer Plymouth Partnership, the community safety partnership for the city. Hate crime data is monitored.	We will continue to monitor hate crime data and work with our partners in the police where appropriate.	Community Connections.
Plymouth is a city where people from different backgrounds get along well.		We will continue to monitor cohesion levels via our survey work.	Policy and Intelligence Team.

backgrounds have opportunities to form relationships may be reduced if the Community Grants budget is reduced	It may not be possible to fully mitigate the adverse impact from the Community Grants programme proposal if there is no longer capacity to make revenue funds available for it.
--	--

This page is intentionally left blank